

## Sustainable Tourism Practices: Arizona Benchmark Study



*Produced for the*



*by the*

**Arizona Hospitality Research & Resource Center**

**Center for Business Outreach**

**The W. A. Franke College of Business**

**Northern Arizona University**

**June 2011**

## Executive Summary

The Arizona Office of Tourism (AOT) contracted with the Arizona Hospitality Research & Resource Center (AHRRC) to conduct a survey of sustainable tourism practices in Arizona, the purpose to collect baseline data on current progress by the industry and establish benchmarks for future research. The Research Division of AOT and the AHRRC created an E-survey which was sent to thousands of practitioners across industry sectors – lodging, restaurants/bars, attractions, travel and tour providers, and destination marketing organizations. In general, the study found that Arizona’s tourism industry is doing a great deal to build a more sustainable future. Large percentages are knowledgeable about sustainability issues, and are responding to community and customer concerns. The majority of organizations are recycling, reducing waste, conserving water and energy, and are celebrating local cultures and sourcing local products.

Specifically, the results of the study for Arizona’s tourism organizations are:

- In May 2011, 2,140 emails were sent and 574 E-surveys were received – a 26.8% response rate.
- Tourism industry organizations in all 15 Arizona counties were represented in the sample, including those on tribal lands (7%).
- All tourism industry sectors were represented; the lodging industry contributed the largest number of responses (34.5%), followed by eating/drinking places (19.3%), destination marketing organizations (18.5%), attractions (17.9%), travel and tour operators (7.3%), and others (2.4%).
- In terms of size, 43% of lodging respondents’ properties had fewer than 50 rooms, 36% had between 50 and 200 rooms, and 21% had more than 200 rooms.
- Restaurant respondents were concentrated in hotels/resorts with food service (84%), free-standing restaurants accounted for 11%, and wineries/distilleries for 5% of the sample.
- Virtually all properties were open year-round (97%); 3% were seasonal.
- About three-fourths of respondents had a working knowledge of sustainability issues – 40% actively seek information and 34% follow news stories on the subject; one-fourth do not (26%).
- A majority already has (32%) or is in the process of creating (28%) a comprehensive sustainability strategy, while 40% have no such plan.
- The top three factors driving sustainable practices are: community environmental concerns (68%), corporate image/brand reputation (65%), and employee interests (41%).
- About half (51%) have an assigned person responsible for sustainability issues, while half do not (49%).
- The main ways sustainability goals and policies are internally communicated are employee training in sustainable operations (42%), manager emails (37%), new employee orientations (36%), and staff meetings (35%).

- Two-thirds communicate sustainability goals/policies to external stakeholders, either to a great (24%) or limited extent (42%); 34% do not.
- Top three strategies to engage external stakeholders are: marketing and social media (58%), identifying sustainability goals/targets (56%), creating more sustainable products and services (49%).
- Half felt they were either somewhat (35%) or completely successful (14%) engaging external stakeholders; 35% were not sure, while 16% said they were not successful.
- The three biggest barriers to developing and implementing strategies and practices are: lack of available funds and prioritization of funds to sustainability issues, listed by 67% of the sample, followed by cost and perceived lack of return on investment (43.8%), and lack of staff to oversee these strategies and practices (43.4%).
- The most commonly practiced waste reduction measures are: recycling, used by 92% of tourism organizations, then general reduction in material use (73%), and donation of used items (55%).
- Two-thirds (68%) are currently implementing water conservation measures; one-third are not.
- Most used water conservation measures are: low-flow/dual-flush toilets (73%), native plants (73%), and low-flow showerheads (59%).
- Four of five (80%) are currently implementing energy reduction measures; 20% are not.
- The three most used energy reduction measures are: low energy lighting/fluorescent/LEDs (83%), encouraging guests/staff to turn off lights (83%), and use of Energy Star appliances (53%).
- Half currently monitor energy and water consumption (48%), while half do not (52%).
- Three-fourths are not currently implementing air quality measures (76%), while one fourth (24%) are doing so. Most common are regularly maintained HVAC systems (78%), use of alternative-fuel vehicles (53%), and use of environmentally responsible cleaners and low VOCs (both 51%).
- Few are located in LEED-certified buildings (14%); most are not (86%).
- Only one in five (22%) actively implements noise reduction measures; 78% do not. Most popular methods are noise ordinances (60%), low noise equipment (51%), and engaging neighbors on noise issues (47%).
- On social/cultural issues, large percentages of tourism organizations:
  - Value the quality of customer experience over the quantity (92%)
  - Celebrate and protect local culture, history, and art (90%)
  - Participate on community councils (84%)
  - Educate customers about their region (80%)
  - Follow fair-trade, locally-sourced, non-exploitive policies (55%)
  - Have mentor and apprenticeship opportunities for locals (50%)
  - Hire from the local community (93%)
  - Donate to charitable organizations (86%)
  - Source supplies locally to support community businesses (82%)
  - Participate in business partnerships to spinoff benefits for local economy (79%)
  - Have a long-term plan for financial sustainability (64%)
  - Encourage employee local volunteerism (55%).
- The vast majority of lodging properties:

- Use water conserving fixtures (80%)
- Purchase guest amenities in bulk (79%)
- Have a linen reuse program (78%)
- Have engineering systems to detect and repair problems (74%)
- Donate excess materials to local non-profits (71%)
- Have preventive maintenance schedules for water-using appliances (66%).
- Majorities of Restaurant and food service properties:
  - Recycle cardboard (86%)
  - Use Energy Star certified appliances (54%)
  - Recycle cooking oil (54%).
- Majorities of Destination Marketing Organizations have:
  - Sustainable programs and activities (62%)
    - specifically:
      - Cultural and heritage programs (82%)
      - Art or historic walks (79%)
      - Bird and wildlife watching (68%)
      - Historic preservation programs (62%)
      - Farmers Markets (56%).
- Most DMOs do not, however, have specific funds allocated to market or promote their activities (74%); 26% do have earmarked funds.
- One-third (36%) of DMOs rate their destination as good or very good in implementing sustainable tourism programs; 55% say they are neither good/nor bad; 9% admit they are bad/very bad.
- Biggest challenges for DMOs in developing and promoting sustainable tourism programs are: cost (67%), time (58%), and expertise (38%).
- The likelihood that DMOs will adopt sustainable tourism programs in the next 12 months are: 32% are likely or very likely; in the next 12-24 months, 38% are likely or very likely.
- About one in five think they have the knowledge and resources to do so, 28% say they do not have, and 50% are not sure – perhaps a call for technical assistance on the issue.
- Almost half (43%) think their destination would be more competitive if they had sustainable tourism programs, only 9% said it would not be, while 47% were not sure.
- The top five sustainable tourism programs now promoted by DMOs are:
  - Historic tourism (86%)
  - Access to state and national parks (71%)
  - Adventure tourism (69%)
  - Galleries/Fine arts/Art Walks (57%)
  - Agricultural tourism/Farmers markets (43%)
- The top three ways that AOT can help DMOs:
  - Marketing materials (66%)
  - How-to guides (60%)
  - Educational services and programs (55%)

- The average number of years these respondents have worked in the tourism industry is 17; average number of years in their current organization is 10.

In conclusion, while much has been accomplished to build a more sustainable future for Arizona's tourism industry, much remains to be done. Awareness of the issues appears to be relatively high, and a number of practices have been widely adopted, such as recycling, water and energy conservation, and linen reuse programs. The biggest barriers concern cost – lack of funds to address sustainability issues, perceived lack of return on investment from implementing sustainable measures, and lack of staff to oversee sustainable strategies and practices. Going forward, the industry should encourage peer-to-peer interactions, especially drawing upon staff that has successfully overseen implementation of sustainable strategies and practices. The industry generally should also disseminate best practices and share experiences, especially those that relate to cost and ROI. In addition, efforts should be increased to educate and ensure that information on sustainable strategies and practices is widely disseminated. Finally, technical assistance is needed to help tourism organizations understand how to market Arizona as a sustainable destination and how to use social media in this effort.

## List of Tables

Table 1. County of respondents .....	10
Table 2. Tribal entity or located on Tribal land .....	11
Table 3. Responses by industry sector, total sample .....	11
Table 4. Lodging Industry Affiliation .....	12
Table 5. Restaurant Industry Affiliation .....	12
Table 6. Lodging property by number of rooms .....	13
Table 7. Campgrounds/RV parks by number of site spaces.....	13
Table 8. Number of employees, full-time and part-time .....	14
Table 9. Full and part-time employees by type of Food service property .....	14
Table 10. Full-time lodging employees during peak season .....	15
Table 11. Part-time lodging employees during peak season .....	15
Table 12. Year-round or seasonal lodging property .....	16
Table 13. Food Service Full and Part Time Employees during peak season .....	16
Table 14. When is the restaurant open? .....	16
Table 15. If seasonal restaurant mark all months open.....	17
Table 16. Current knowledge of sustainable practices .....	18
Table 17. Development of comprehensive sustainability strategies .....	19
Table 18. Driving factors behind sustainability initiatives .....	19
Table 19. Responsible person assigned to implement sustainable strategies .....	20
Table 20. Internal communication of sustainability goals and policies .....	20
Table 21. Communicating goals and policies to external stakeholders.....	21
Table 22. Strategies for engaging external stakeholders.....	21
Table 23. Engaging stakeholders in sustainability strategies/initiatives.....	22
Table 24. Significant barriers organizations face in developing and implementing sustainable strategies and practices.....	22
Table 25. Waste reduction measures .....	23
Table 26. Currently implementing water conservation measures .....	23
Table 27. Water conservation measures currently being implemented .....	24
Table 28. Is your organization currently implementing any measures to reduce energy usage?.....	24
Table 29. Energy efficiency measures currently being implemented.....	25
Table 30. Monitor energy and water consumption to determine effects of conservation.....	26
Table 31. Is your organization currently implementing any Air Quality measures?.....	26
Table 32. Air quality measures currently being implemented.....	27
Table 33. Organization located in a LEED Certified Building or building seeking LEED certification .....	27
Table 34. Organization currently implementing Noise Reduction measures .....	28
Table 35. Noise reduction measures currently being implemented .....	28
Table 36. Are Socio-cultural issues currently being implemented by your organization? .....	29
Table 37. Tourism benefits for the local community.....	30
Table 38. Sustainable lodging practices .....	32
Table 39. Lodging or Camping property has restaurant/eating facility & kitchen that prepares hot food .....	33
Table 40. Type of food service facility.....	33
Table 41. Please list your sustainable restaurant practices? .....	34
Table 42. Comparing data from 2007 Minnesota study vs. 2011 Arizona study .....	35
Table 43. Public expectations of sustainable practices compared to AZ & US tourism practices .....	36

Table 44. Is your destination currently involved in any sustainable tourism programs or activities? .....	37
Table 45. What types of sustainable programs is your destination/DMO currently involved in? .....	38
Table 46. Specific funds allocated to market or promote sustainable tourism programs and/or activities in your community.....	38
Table 47. Overall, how well would you rate your destination in implementing sustainable tourism programs? .....	39
Table 48. Primary challenges encountered in developing or promoting sustainable tourism programs in destinations.....	40
Table 49. Likelihood your destination will adopt sustainable tourism programs in next 12 months .....	40
Table 50. Likelihood your destination will adopt and/or implement sustainable tourism programs within the next 12 - 24 months.....	41
Table 51. Do you feel you have the knowledge/information/resources to implement a sustainable tourism program in your destination?.....	41
Table 52. Will your destination become more competitive (i.e., greater ability to retain or attract visitors) with the implementation of sustainable tourism programs? .....	42
Table 53. Which of the following sustainable programs or opportunities exists for your destination? ...	42
Table 54. How can the Arizona Office of Tourism assist you in implementing sustainable tourism approaches and tourism? .....	43
Table 55. Number of years working in the tourism industry and for your organization .....	43

## INTRODUCTION

The world has been on a sometimes slow but inexorable path toward protecting the environment, promoting sustainable development, implementing more energy-efficient practices, and building a more sustainable future. What is the state of sustainable development in Arizona's tourism industry? This study is a first attempt to answer this question at a statewide level for all sectors of the tourism industry – hotels, restaurants, destination marketing associations, attractions, and other service providers.

Whether it is recycling materials, conserving water, or using energy-efficient appliances, the various sectors of the Arizona tourism industry have made progress in response to the general sustainability movement, to growing internal budget pressures, and to increasing customer expectations for sustainable experiences. Others have expressed this challenge as an effort to measure the “Triple Bottom Line,” which focuses on corporate social responsibility and accountability, not just for economic issues, but for environmental, economic and social progress.

Notable markers on the timeline of the world's sustainable development would include the following:

- **1970.** Creation of the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, to carry out federal laws to protect the environment and improve and preserve the quality of the environment, human health and natural resources.
- **1972.** United Nations Conference on the Human Environment (the Stockholm Conference) in which developed nations expressed concerns about the environmental consequences of increased global development.
- **1975.** International Environmental Educational Program (IEEP) created by the United Nations to recommend sustainable policies and actions to the governments of the world.
- **1983.** The Bruntland Commission, a United Nations program to formulate proposals to address the world's environmental and development problems, defined sustainable development as, “development that meets the needs of the present without compromising the ability of future generations to meet their own needs.”
- **1992.** The Rio Earth Summit produced greatly increased participation by the world's governments, and led to the creation of Agenda 21, a list of recommended sustainable practices for the 21<sup>st</sup> Century.
- **1997.** The Kyoto Climate Agreement coalesced sustainability issues around the issue of global climate change, as many nations pledged to reduce their greenhouse gas emissions and promote sustainable development to mitigate global warming.
- **2002.** World Summit on Sustainable Development focused on sustainable development in an era of rapid globalization, focusing on sustainable development in five priority areas: water, energy, health, agriculture and biodiversity.

**Definitions of Sustainable Tourism.** Generally, definitions of sustainable development have focused on three areas:

- **Environmental.** The environmental focus grew out of the earth sciences and emphasizes conservation of natural resources for future generations and biodiversity.
- **Economic.** The economic focus has been on the consumption of resources, on preserving economic opportunity for all of the world’s people.
- **Social.** The social focus is on security and social justice, on addressing poverty and the sharing of the world’s resources, and on human relationship to nature.

The survey began by providing respondents with a definition of sustainable tourism used by the Arizona Office of Tourism, which was the following:

*"Sustaining the culture, heritage and environment of a region while at the same time promoting economic growth and social wellbeing through tourism."*

~Arizona Sustainable Tourism Council

Respondents were then asked, “How do *you* define sustainable tourism?” The full-text responses for the 290 who answered this question are presented in Appendix B. These definitions were sorted and clustered into six topic areas, as follows:

➤ Focus on Environmental Issues	78 responses	(27%)
➤ Focus on Maintaining the present	67 responses	(23%)
➤ Focus on Environmental/Economic/Social	56 responses	(19%)
➤ Focus on Economic Issues	46 responses	(16%)
➤ Focus on Social Issues	26 responses	( 9%)
➤ Focus on Other Issues	<u>17 responses</u>	( 6%)
	290 count total	

In terms of this list, the one that most closely matches the AOT definition is the third which addresses all three factors – Environmental/Economic/Social. This definition was, however, used by only 19% of the sample, suggesting a possible disconnect within the industry about what sustainable tourism is and is not. Examples of specific comments in each of these areas are shown below.

- **Environmental** – One of the classic definitions of the sustainability movement is based on preserving the environment. Sample definitions from respondents included:

- I define sustainability as consciousness of the effect of all day-to-day endeavors on the natural environment and ensuring that all practices are minimally invasive/destructive to the environment.
- Understanding the effects we have on the environment and working to limit our impact, implementing environmentally sensitive policies and procedures in the workplace.
- **Economic** – Another definition of sustainability is based on management of human consumption of resources, based on information from economics, such as:
  - A process or practice employed by businesses and organizations to maximize economic growth while minimizing environmental and negative social impact.
  - Doing business in a way that is good for the environment both today and in the future.
- **Social** – These definitions focus on social challenges and ways of living more sustainable lifestyles, thus preserving human history and cultures, such as:
  - Maintaining the cultures and historical character of an area and helping visitors or tourists understand the unique appeal of the area’s culture and history in order to enrich the tourism experience.
  - To keep local resources and historical /cultural aspects of an area from being depleted while making them accessible to the public.
- **Maintaining** – At its most basic, sustainability is defined as the capacity to endure; and, many respondents defined it as maintaining what we have for future generations:
  - The process of enduring, maintaining and preserving.
  - Sustaining, building over a long period of time, and making things last.
- **Combination of Environmental/Economic/Social** – Many people mentioned all three of these factors in their definitions – environmental, economic and social.
  - It is the ability to merge economy and ecology into a single system. Also, living within the resources of our state, country, and world without damaging the environment. Making sure we have a planet and resources to leave to our grandchildren.
  - Protection of environmental, economic and social entities with the goal of providing resources for our future.
- **Other** – Some people offered definitions that could not be easily classified.
  - The ability to use/promote/interpret available resources to promote a given tourist area, but in a way that is not a detriment to resources.
  - I like the AOT definition.
  - Be Hopi.

## Methods

This survey represents a first-of-a-kind effort by the Arizona Office of Tourism to benchmark the current “state of the industry” in terms of sustainable tourism practices. Thus, the Arizona Office of Tourism (AOT) commissioned the Arizona Hospitality Research & Resource Center (AHRRC) at Northern Arizona University to undertake a survey that would provide baseline data on tourism industry sustainable practices. An online survey instrument was developed by AHRRC in conjunction with AOT (see instrument in Appendix A), which was then created in Qualtrics™ E-survey software. In May 2011 an

email, containing a link to the E-survey, was sent to a convenience sample of 2,140 persons in organizations across all sectors of Arizona’s tourism industry, including: lodging/campgrounds, restaurants, attractions (public, private& non-profit), destination marketing organizations, and tour operators and travel agents.

The invitation to complete the survey was sent out on May 3, 2011, after which respondents were given two and a half weeks to complete and return the survey to the AHRRC. Reminders were sent to those who had not responded to encourage their participation, after which the survey was closed on Friday, May 20. Of the initial sample list of 2,140 names and email addresses, a total of 574 responses were received that were either totally or partially completed, resulting in a response rate of 26.8%, a relatively high response rate for an online survey. The next section presents a description of the survey sample that was achieved.

### Description of the Survey Sample

The sustainability survey was sent to a statewide sample of respondents, and responses were returned from all 15 Arizona counties (574 total responses). As shown in Table 1, Maricopa County contributed the largest number of responses, about one-third (32.9%), followed by sizeable numbers of responses from Pima County (12.4%), Yavapai County (12.5%), and Coconino County (12.4%). The fewest responses were received from the counties of Graham (.5%), Greenlee (.3%) and La Paz (.5%).

**Table 1. County of respondents**

	Count	Percent
Apache County	14	2.4%
Cochise County	35	6.1%
Coconino County	71	12.4%
Gila County	12	2.1%
Graham County	3	.5%
Greenlee County	2	.3%
La Paz County	3	.5%
Maricopa County	189	32.9%
Mohave County	25	4.4%
Navajo County	22	3.8%
Pima County	71	12.4%
Pinal County	24	4.2%
Santa Cruz County	14	2.4%
Yavapai County	72	12.5%
Yuma County	17	3.0%
Total	574	100.0%

To represent the many Arizona tribes that are large players in Arizona’s tourism industry, respondents were asked if they were a tribal entity or located on tribal land. In all, 6.9% of completed responses were from tribal representatives and organizations located on tribal lands, as shown in Table 2.

**Table 2. Tribal entity or located on Tribal land**

	Count	Percent
Yes	32	6.9%
No	433	93.1%
Total	465	100.0%

Respondents were asked to specify the part of the hospitality industry with which they were affiliated, and these responses are shown in Table 3. Most represented was the Accommodations sector, accounting for 50.7% or half of respondents. This group is divided in Table 3 between Accommodations *without food service* (34.5%) and Accommodations *with food service* (16.2%). Next in importance were Marketing organizations, at 18.5% of total responses, representing Destination Marketing Organizations (DMOs) and Convention & Visitors Bureaus (CVBs). These were followed by Attractions, both public (7.7%) and non-profit (7.1%), as well as a smaller number of private attractions (3.1%). While stand-alone restaurants and bars accounted for only a small percentage of responses (3.1%), if they are combined with accommodations *with food service* category, then they represent 19.4% of the total sample or one in five responses. Finally, 2.4% identified themselves as “other,” which included several magazine and media outlets along with several metaphysical/yoga establishments.

**Table 3. Responses by industry sector, total sample**

	Count	Percent
Accommodations without food service	198	34.5%
Accommodation with food service	93	16.2%
Restaurant/Eating & Drinking Place	18	3.1%
Convention Visitor's Bureau/Destination Marketing Organization	106	18.5%
Attraction - Public	44	7.7%
Attraction - Private	18	3.1%
Attraction - Non Profit	41	7.1%
Travel/Tour Operators	42	7.3%
Other	14	2.4%
Total	574	100.0%

Respondents in the accommodations sector reported various affiliations as shown in Table 4. The largest cohort was reported for the category of Hotel/motel/historic inns *without* food service (40.3%), followed by Hotel/motel/historic inns *with* food service (13.7%), then by Resorts with food service (17.4%), Bed & Breakfast establishments (13.7%), then RV parks (7.2%), Campgrounds (4.1%), and Cabins/guest ranches/lodges (3.8%). Thus, the lodging sector provided a total of 293 responses or 51.0%, more than half of the sample.

**Table 4. Lodging Industry Affiliation**

	Count	Percent
Hotel/Motel/Historic Inn without food service	118	40.3%
Hotel/Motel/Historic Inn with food service	40	13.7%
Resort	51	17.4%
Bed & Breakfast	40	13.7%
Campground	12	4.1%
RV Park	21	7.2%
Cabins, Guest Ranches, Lodges etc.	11	3.8%
Total	293	100.0%

Among those in the restaurant sector, the breakdown of types is presented in Table 5. The largest group of restaurants was that located in Hotels/Resorts with food service, representing 83.8% of respondents. Next in percentage of responses were free-standing Restaurants/Bistros (10.8%), followed by Wineries/distilleries (5.4%). Thus, the restaurant sector provided a total of 111 responses or 20.5% of the sample.

**Table 5. Restaurant Industry Affiliation**

	Count	Percent
Hotels/Resorts with food service	93	83.8%
Restaurants/Bistros	12	10.8%
Wineries/Distilleries	6	5.4%
Total	111	100.0%

Lodging respondents were also asked to indicate the number of rooms in their property, and these results are shown in Table 6. The largest group (39.0%) was for the smallest size category of 0 to 25 rooms, representing B & B or boutique properties. Next, were lodging properties in the 101 to 200 room size, accounting for 20.6% of the sample. Properties of 51 to 100 rooms accounted for 15.4% of the sample, followed by properties with 500+ rooms (5.1%), 26 to 50 rooms (4.4%), and finally those with 401 to 500 rooms (2.2%). Clearly, while small properties are well-represented, lodging properties in all size categories are represented – with 36.0% in the 51 to 200 room categories, and 20.5% in the 200+ room categories.

**Table 6. Lodging property by number of rooms**

	Count	Percent
0 to 25 rooms	53	39.0%
26 to 50 rooms	6	4.4%
51 to 100 rooms	21	15.4%
101 to 200 rooms	28	20.6%
201 to 300 rooms	12	8.8%
301 to 400 rooms	6	4.4%
401 to 500 rooms	3	2.2%
500+ rooms	7	5.1%
Total	136	100.0%

Similarly, campgrounds and RV parks were asked to indicate the number of site spaces, in the ranges shown below. The largest group of these (46.2%) was in the smallest size category of 0 to 100 sites. Next in importance were respondents in the 101 to 249 sites (23.1%), and those in the 500+ sites, which represented an equal 23.1% of respondents. Mid-size sites (250 thru 499 sites) accounted for 7.7% of the sample. See Table 7.

**Table 7. Campgrounds/RV parks by number of site spaces**

	Count	Percent
0 thru 100 sites	6	46.2%
101 thru 249 sites	3	23.1%
250 thru 499 sites	1	7.7%
500+ sites	3	23.1%
Total	13	100.0%

Lodging and restaurant respondents were asked about number of employees and whether employees worked full or part-time. As shown in Table 8, Hotels/motels/inns *without* food service employ an average of 33 people full-time and 14 part-time during peak season; likewise, Hotel/motel/inns *with* food service employ an average of 159 full-time employees and 52 part-time during peak season. Resorts employ 277 full-time and 173 part-time during peak season, and so on. B&Bs, campgrounds, RV parks and Cabins/guest ranches/lodges employ far fewer during all seasons. See Table 8.

**Table 8. Number of employees, full-time and part-time**

Type of Lodging property	Full-time Employment - peak season	Part-time Employment - peak season
	Mean	Mean
Hotel/Motel/Historic Inn without food service	33	14
Hotel/Motel/Historic Inn with food service	159	52
Resort	277	173
Bed & Breakfast	18	2
Campground	5	8
RV Park	18	10
Cabins, Guest Ranches, Lodges etc.	21	2

Table 9 presents the same information on average number of full and part-time employees for the Food Service industry. Hotels and resorts *with* food service employ an average of 121 full-time and 31 part-time during peak season; smaller restaurants/bistros, as well as wineries/distilleries employ far fewer full and part-time people.

**Table 9. Full and part-time employees by type of Food service property**

Type of food service property	Full-time Peak Employees	Part-time Peak Employees
	Mean	Mean
Hotels/Resorts with food service	121	31
Restaurants/Bistros	19	27
Wineries/Distilleries	30	15

Table 10 presents the data on full-time lodging employees during peak season slightly differently. In this configuration, 40.5% of properties had fewer than 10 full-time employees during peak season, while 20.7% of properties had 25-50 employees during peak season. About a quarter of properties (a combined 24.2%) had between 51 and 300 full-time employees during peak season. Therefore, the average or mean number of full-time employees during peak season is 71, while the median is 22 employees.

**Table 10. Full-time lodging employees during peak season**

	Count	Percent
< 10 employees	47	40.5%
11 - 24 employees	12	10.3%
25 - 50 employees	24	20.7%
51 -100 employees	9	7.8%
101 - 200 employees	9	7.8%
201 - 300 employees	10	8.6%
301 - 400 employees	3	2.6%
401 - 500 employees	1	.9%
500+ employees	1	.9%
Total	116	100.0%

Mean = 71 employees  
 Median = 22 employees

Similarly, Table 11 shows that almost two-thirds of lodging properties (62.5%) had fewer than 10 part-time employees during peak season; 10.2% had 11-24 part-time employees, and 13.6% had 25-50 part-time employees. The average or mean number of part-time employees per property is 37, while the median is 6 employees during peak season.

**Table 11. Part-time lodging employees during peak season**

	Count	Percent
< 10 employees	55	62.5%
11 - 24 employees	9	10.2%
25 - 50 employees	12	13.6%
51 -100 employees	7	8.0%
101 - 200 employees	2	2.3%
201 - 300 employees	1	1.1%
301 - 400 employees	1	1.1%
401 - 500 employees	0	.0%
500+ employees	1	1.1%
Total	88	100.0%

Mean = 37 employees  
 Median = 6 employees

This sample consisted almost entirely of tourism organizations that operate on a year-round basis – fully 96.6%. Only a tiny fraction, five properties (3.4%), reported that they were seasonal operations. For those five properties that operated seasonally, they were most likely to be open during the Spring (March through May) and the Fall (September through November) and less likely to be open during the Winter and Summer. See Table 12 on year-round vs. seasonal properties.

**Table 12. Year-round or seasonal lodging property**

	Count	Percent
Year-round	144	96.6%
Seasonally	5	3.4%
Total	149	100.0%

Next, respondents with food service were asked for the average number of full and part-time employees during peak season. Table 13 shows that the average or mean number of full-time employees in restaurants during peak season is 70, while the median is 20 employees. The average number of part-time employees is 39, while the median is 8.

**Table 13. Food Service Full and Part Time Employees during peak season**

	Mean	Median
Full-time	70	20
Part-time	39	8

Then, respondents were asked whether their restaurant or food service facility was open year-round or seasonally. The vast majority (89.5%) reported they were open year-round, while only one in ten (10.5%) were seasonal operations. See Table 14.

**Table 14. When is the restaurant open?**

	Count	Percent
Year-round	85	89.5%
Seasonally	10	10.5%
Total	95	100.0%

Those that were open seasonally, were asked to specify the months they were open. As shown below, restaurant facilities were most likely to be open from October through May, and less likely to be open from June through September. See Table 15.

**Table 15. If seasonal restaurant mark all months open**

	Count	Percent
January	11	84.6%
February	12	92.3%
March	12	92.3%
April	12	92.3%
May	11	84.6%
June	8	61.5%
July	7	53.8%
August	7	53.8%
September	7	53.8%
October	10	76.9%
November	13	100.0%
December	11	84.6%

## Description of Survey Findings

**Planning & Implementation.** After the descriptive questions, the first part of the survey addressed issues of leadership, planning, implementation and communication of sustainable goals and objectives. The survey began with a question to gauge respondents’ self-rated knowledge of sustainable practices. As shown in Table 16, levels of knowledge were somewhat evenly divided among three groups:

- Those who actively seek out information on the environment and social issues (39.6%);
- Those whose knowledge is from passively following news or media stories about sustainability (33.9%); and,
- Those who recognize some terms or buzz words, but who feel they do not have a full understanding of sustainability issues (26.5%).

Therefore, about three-fourths of respondents judged they had a working knowledge of sustainability issues. See Table 16.

**Table 16. Current knowledge of sustainable practices**

	Count	Percent
I recognize terms or buzz words, but I don’t have a full understanding of the issues.	107	26.5%
I know what I hear on the news or read in mainstream media.	137	33.9%
I seek out information on environmental and social issues of concern.	160	39.6%
Total	404	100.0%

Did the organizations that these respondents represent have a sustainability strategy? About one-third (32.2%) said their organization had such a strategy; one-fourth (27.6%) said their organization was in the process of developing a strategy; and, the remainder (40.1%) said their organization did not have a current plan to promote sustainable practices. Thus, a majority (60%) already had or was in the process of developing a strategy to promote sustainable practices in the organization. See Table 17.

**Table 17. Development of comprehensive sustainability strategies**

	Count	Percent
No current plan	148	40.1%
No, but in the process of doing so	102	27.6%
Yes	119	32.2%
Total	369	100.0%

A follow-up question asked respondents to identify the driving factors behind their organizations' sustainability initiatives. Most important were community environmental concerns (67.5%) and corporate image or brand reputation (64.6%), identified by fully two-thirds of the sample as the two most important forces driving sustainable initiatives. Employee interests (41.1%) were also high on the list of motivating factors, followed by about one-third who identified end-consumer environmental concerns (31.2%) and Government compliance (30.9%) as the driving factors. In the "Other" category (17.2%) were factors such as: personal/employer interest, "it's the right thing to do", and National Park Service mission. Supply chain pressures accounted for a smaller percentage (15.9%), along with pressures from investors (10.8%). See the full list in Table 18 and the full list of "other" factors in Appendix B.

**Table 18. Driving factors behind sustainability initiatives**

	Count	Percent
Community Environmental Concern	212	67.5%
Corporate Image/Brand Reputation	203	64.6%
Employee Interests	129	41.1%
End-Consumer Environmental Concerns/Pressure From Customers	98	31.2%
Government Compliance	97	30.9%
Other	54	17.2%
Supply Chain Pressure/Interest	50	15.9%
Investors	34	10.8%

When asked whether their organization had an assigned person who was responsible for implementing sustainable strategies, the responses were evenly split: 51.3% said yes and 48.7% said no. See Table 19.

**Table 19. Responsible person assigned to implement sustainable strategies**

	Count	Percent
No	174	48.7%
Yes	183	51.3%
Total	357	100.0%

How do tourism organizations internally communicate sustainability goals and policies? The most important way is through employee training programs, which are in effect at 42.0% of organizations. About a third of respondents also use: emails from senior managers (36.6%), new employee orientations (35.8%), and company intranets (34.2%). About one-fourth use performance evaluations to impart this information (26.1%) or posters in the workplace (22.6%). The “other” methods of internal communication, totaling one-third (35.4%) of all responses in this category, were dominated by employee and staff committee meetings. See Table 20.

**Table 20. Internal communication of sustainability goals and policies**

	Count	Percent
Employee Training in Sustainable Operations	108	42.0%
Emails from Senior Managers to Employees	94	36.6%
New Employee Orientation	92	35.8%
Other	91	35.4%
Company Intranet	88	34.2%
Performance Evaluations	67	26.1%
Posters in Workplace	58	22.6%

Does not sum to 100% due to multiple responses

How much do tourism organizations communicate sustainability goals and policies to external stakeholders (communities, shareholders, customers, governments, etc.)? About one-fourth (23.7%) communicate goals and policies to those outside their organization to a great extent; 42.4% communicate to a limited extent; and one-third (33.9%) say they do not communicate sustainability goals and policies at all externally. Overall, about two-thirds of tourism organizations do communicate their sustainable goals and policies to interested external groups. See Table 21.

**Table 21. Communicating goals and policies to external stakeholders**

	Count	Percent
Not at all	116	33.9%
To a limited extent	145	42.4%
To a great extent	81	23.7%
Total	342	100.0%

Knowing that a majority of tourism organizations communicate their policies to external stakeholders, how do they go about engaging external stakeholders in their sustainability goals? Marketing approaches are the most common methods, including social marketing, used by 57.6%. A majority also use identification of sustainable goals and targets (55.6%) to communicate externally, while some create more sustainable products or services (49.3%), or suggest partnerships with non-profits or other groups (43.9%). Some try to influence social and environmental practices (40.5%), provide feedback or press releases on their sustainable programs (27.3%) or test and engage in advertising campaigns (13.2%). “Other” strategies included such things as employee training and education of customers. See all responses in Table 22.

**Table 22. Strategies for engaging external stakeholders**

	Count	Percent
Develop marketing (including social marketing) approaches	118	57.6%
Identify sustainability goals or targets	114	55.6%
Create more sustainable products or services	101	49.3%
Suggest non-profits or other groups to partner with	90	43.9%
Influence social or environmental practices	83	40.5%
Provide feedback on reports or press releases	56	27.3%
Test advertising campaigns	27	13.2%
Other	24	11.7%

How successful have these outreach strategies been for tourism organizations? About half said their strategies were either successful (13.6%) or somewhat successful (34.6%), while a much smaller group thought they were unsuccessful (6.8%) or somewhat unsuccessful (9.7%). The largest single group, about one-third (35.3%), said they were not sure how successful their outreach had been. See Table 23.

**Table 23. Engaging stakeholders in sustainability strategies/initiatives**

	Count	Percent
Not Sure	109	35.3%
Unsuccessful	21	6.8%
Somewhat Unsuccessful	30	9.7%
Somewhat Successful	107	34.6%
Successful	42	13.6%
Total	309	100.0%

What are the most significant barriers that tourism organizations face in developing and implementing sustainable strategies and practices? The most significant is the lack of available funds and prioritization of funds for sustainability issues – chosen by two-thirds of the sample (66.4%) as the biggest barrier. This was followed by cost and perceived lack of return on investment, chosen by 43.8% of the sample. Next, was lack of staff to oversee these strategies and practices (43.4%). The next barrier, listed by about a third (36.2%), was the complexity of implementing sustainable strategies and practices, followed by lack of adequate education and training by a fourth (25.3%). Finally, one in five (19.1%) said there was no significant business driver to push sustainable policies, and 5.9% said senior management was indifferent. See Table 24.

**Table 24. Significant barriers organizations face in developing and implementing sustainable strategies and practices**

	Count	Percent
Availability of funds/Prioritization of funds	202	66.4%
Cost/Perceived lack of return on investment	133	43.8%
Complexity of implementation	110	36.2%
Lack of staff	132	43.4%
Lack of adequate sustainability-related education/training	77	25.3%
No significant business driver	58	19.1%
Senior management indifference	18	5.9%
Other:	41	13.5%

## Findings on Sustainable Practices

Waste reduction measures are the most common way that tourism practitioners are making their organizations more sustainable. Almost all organizations (91.5%) have implemented a recycling program to environmentally discard the waste of both staff and customers. Almost three-fourths (73.3%) have policies to reduce use of materials whenever possible. More than half (54.7%) donate used items so materials can be recycled or reused. About half (48.2%) have policies to buy products that contain recycled materials, and one-third (34.4%) reuse or purchase biodegradable dishes and utensils. Another third (32.0%) collect and compost materials from kitchens and landscapes, and about one in five organizations (19%) have other waste reduction measures, including: grey water systems, rain collection, or converting vehicles to propane use. (See full list of “others” in Appendix B.) See Table 25.

**Table 25. Waste reduction measures**

	Count	Percent
A recycling program to collect recyclables from staff and customer	226	91.5%
Procedures in place to reduce use of materials wherever possible	181	73.3%
Donation of used items	135	54.7%
A policy exists to buy products that contain recycled materials	119	48.2%
Reusable or biodegradable dishes and utensils	85	34.4%
Collect and compost materials including kitchen and/or landscaping	79	32.0%
Other waste reduction measures:	47	19.0%

Two-thirds of these tourism organizations (67.5%) are currently implementing water conservation measures, while one-third (32.5%) say they are not doing so. See Table 26.

**Table 26. Currently implementing water conservation measures**

	Count	Percent
No	106	32.5%
Yes	220	67.5%
Total	326	100.0%

The water conservation measures currently being implemented by tourism organizations in Arizona are many. Low flush or dual flush toilets are used by three-fourths (73.2%), as are native landscape plants that consume less water (72.7%). More than half of organizations also use low flow showerheads (58.9%) and faucet aerators to reduce water flow (51.2%). In addition, 42.1% have signage asking customers to minimize water usage, and one-third (32.1%) use xeriscaping or water-saving techniques to reduce or eliminate the need for irrigation. Other interior water management systems are used by about one-fourth of organizations (23.0%), and sink motion sensors are utilized by one in five organizations (19.1%) to turn off water when not in use. A smaller percentage (4.8%) use toilet dams to reduce the amount of water per flush. See Table 27.

**Table 27. Water conservation measures currently being implemented**

	Count	Percent
Low-flow or dual flush toilets	153	73.2%
Native plants used in landscaping	152	72.7%
Low-flow showerheads	123	58.9%
Faucet aerators	107	51.2%
Signage asking customers to minimize water usage	88	42.1%
Xeriscape	67	32.1%
Other interior water management systems	48	23.0%
Sink motion sensors	40	19.1%
Toilet dams	10	4.8%

Measures to reduce energy usage are another important strategy, and these are currently being used by four out of five organizations (79.8%). The remaining 20.2% say they do not currently have measures in place to reduce energy usage. See Table 28.

**Table 28. Is your organization currently implementing any measures to reduce energy usage?**

	Count	Percent
No	65	20.2%
Yes	257	79.8%
Total	322	100.0%

The two most common energy efficiency measures currently in use are: encouraging staff and customers to turn off the lights when not in use (83.3%), and low energy lighting (solar, compact fluorescent and LED), which is used by 82.9% of the sample. More than half of organizations (52.9%) also use Energy Star™ efficient appliances and equipment. About four in 10 organizations (42.0%) have improved insulation to minimize heating/cooling loss, while a third (31.9%) encourage staff and customers to ride share, bicycle or use public transportation. Three in 10 organizations (28.8%) use daylight or passive solar, and smaller percentages use alternate fuel vehicles (17.1%) or renewable energy systems (15.2%). Some identified “other” energy efficiency measures (15.2%), and these included: Dark Sky policies, buying newer vehicles, or programmable thermostats. See Table 29.

**Table 29. Energy efficiency measures currently being implemented**

	Count	Percent
Encourage staff and customers to turn off lights	214	83.3%
Low energy lighting (solar, compact fluorescent, LED)	213	82.9%
Energy Star/Energy efficient equipment	136	52.9%
Improved insulation to minimize heating/cooling loss	108	42.0%
Motion sensors to control lighting	104	40.5%
Encouraging staff and customers to rideshare, bicycle or use public transportation	82	31.9%
Utilize daylight/passive solar	74	28.8%
Alternative fuel vehicles (eg hybrids, biodiesel, electric, E85)	44	17.1%
Renewable energy system (eg solar, wind, biomass, thermal)	39	15.2%
Other energy efficiency measures:	39	15.2%

About half of tourism organizations (48.3%) monitor their energy and water consumption to measure how well they are meeting conservation goals, while half (51.7%) do not monitor energy and water use. See Table 30.

**Table 30. Monitor energy and water consumption to determine effects of conservation**

	Count	Percent
No	166	51.7%
Yes	155	48.3%
Total	321	100.0%

When it comes to air quality measures, tourism organizations are doing less than they are in some other areas – three-fourths (75.9%) are not currently implementing any air quality measures, while one-fourth (24.1%) say they are implementing some air quality measures. See Table 31.

**Table 31. Is your organization currently implementing any Air Quality measures?**

	Count	Percent
No	243	75.9%
Yes	77	24.1%
Total	320	100.0%

Among the 24.1% who are implementing air quality measures, the most common is a regularly-maintained HVAC system to minimize bacteria and air flow obstructions (78.2%). Next, about half of respondents minimize vehicle emissions through use of alternative fuels (52.6%), use environmentally responsible cleaners (51.3%), or low VOC paint, carpet and other materials (51.3%). A third responded they have an indoor air quality management system (34.6%), and a fourth of them have taken steps to reduce emissions from fireplaces or incinerators (25.6%). Some “other” air quality measures being used include: dust control, non-smoking rooms, or watering dirt roads. See Table 32.

**Table 32. Air quality measures currently being implemented**

	Count	Percent
HVAC system is regularly maintained and all mold, bacteria and air flow obstructions removed	61	78.2%
Vehicle emissions are reduced through use of alternative fuel vehicles	41	52.6%
Environmentally responsible cleaners are used	40	51.3%
Low VOC (Volatile Organic Compound) paint, adhesives, carpeting, air fresheners or other materials are used	40	51.3%
Indoor air quality management system in use	27	34.6%
Reduced emissions from fireplaces and incinerators	20	25.6%
Other air quality measures	12	15.4%

Few tourism organizations were located in LEED certified buildings (Leadership for Energy and Environmental Design) or in buildings seeking LEED certification from the U.S. Green Building Council. Only 13.8% were pursuing this sustainability option, while the vast majority (86.2%) was not. See Table 33.

**Table 33. Organization located in a LEED Certified Building or building seeking LEED certification**

	Count	Percent
No	256	86.2%
Yes	41	13.8%
Total	297	100.0%

Similarly, on the issue of noise reduction, fewer Arizona tourism entities have implemented any sustainable practices – only about one-fourth (22.3%) had done so, while fully 77.7% had not implemented measures to reduce noise pollution. See Table 34.

**Table 34. Organization currently implementing Noise Reduction measures**

	Count	Percent
No	248	77.7%
Yes	71	22.3%
Total	319	100.0%

Among the 22.3% of organizations that had taken noise reduction measures, the most common method in use was enforcement of quiet hours or a reduced noise ordinance (59.7%), followed by use of low noise equipment (51.4%), and engagement with neighbors on noise issues (47.2%). Some “other” measures in use included: non-powered lawn equipment (mowers/blowers), and sound-proof walls and windows. See Table 35.

**Table 35. Noise reduction measures currently being implemented**

	Count	Percent
Enforce quiet hours or a reduced noise ordinance	43	59.7%
Use low noise equipment	37	51.4%
Engaged with neighbors on possible noise issues	34	47.2%
Other noise reduction practices:	17	23.6%

The next section asked respondents to consider a series of socio-cultural issues and check all those that were being implemented in their tourism organizations; high levels of involvement were found on most of these issues. As shown in Table 36, almost all respondents (92.0%) said their organization values the *quality* of the customer experience over the *quantity* of customers. Likewise, the vast majority of respondents (89.8%) said that their organization actively celebrates and promotes local culture, history, art and cultural events. The vast majority (84.1%) also said their tourism organizations participate on community committees, and that they make an effort to educate their customers about the region (79.6%). Fewer, but still about half of organizations have a “buy local” or fair-trade purchasing policy that benefits the local area, while half (50.0%) also provide mentoring and other learning opportunities for local citizens. See Table 36.

**Table 36. Are Socio-cultural issues currently being implemented by your organization?**

	Count	Percent
Does your organization value quality of customer experience over quantity of customers?	289	92.0%
Does your organization actively celebrate and promote local culture? For example, through protection of local historic sites, use of local art, or participation in cultural events	282	89.8%
Do you and/or someone in your organization participate on community committees or councils?	264	84.1%
Does your organization educate customers of your region	250	79.6%
Does your organization have a purchase policy that favors products that are fair-trade, locally sourced, free of child labor, do not exploit the environment and/or are organic?	174	55.4%
Does your organization provide learning opportunities for locals? For example through mentoring or apprenticeships	157	50.0%

How much do tourism organizations cooperate and work with the local community to ensure that tourism benefits local residents as well as visitors. Almost all tourism sector respondents (93%) said they hire from the local community, and 86.3% said they support local charities. Four out of five organizations (81.5%) said they source supplies locally, as well as participate in partnerships with other local businesses to benefit the local economy. Almost two-thirds (63.9%) said they have a long-term financial or business plan to ensure they stay viable and continue to benefit the local community. More than half (55.0%) said they also encourage their employees to volunteer in fundraising activities to benefit the local community. All of these are evidence of the industry “giving back” to the local community in significant ways. See Table 37.

**Table 37. Tourism benefits for the local community**

	Count	Percent
Does your organization hire people from the local community?	291	93.0%
Does your organization support charitable organizations through donations either financially or in-kind?	270	86.3%
Does your organization source supplies locally to support your local community?	255	81.5%
Does your organization participate in any partnerships with other local businesses to encourage the economic benefits of tourism spin-off to the entire local economy?	248	79.2%
Does your organization have a long-term financial plan to ensure your own economic sustainability?	200	63.9%
Does your organization encourage employee volunteerism through paid volunteer time or participation in fundraising activities such as walk-a-thons, bake sales or silent auctions?	172	55.0%

## Lodging-Specific Questions

The U.S. lodging sector has made great strides in recent years toward reducing its environmental footprint. A number of best practices, such as linen reuse programs, have been widely adopted, and many programs exist, in the U.S. and internationally, that rate and encourage green practices, some of which are listed below.

- **Audubon Green Leaf Eco-Rating Program:** Through a straight-forward and cost-effective five-stage process, properties earn a rating of one to five Green Leafs based on water quality, water conservation, waste minimization, resource conservation, and energy efficiency.
- **Going Green:** The Prince of Wales Foundation International Tourism Partnership (ITP) program is a primer and an excellent starter program to develop energy, water, and waste conservation programs.
- **Green Key Global:** Green Key is comprised of a self-administered audit focused on hotel operations and environmental practices, coupled with onsite inspections to verify a hotel's rating. AH&LA members can save up to 45%, depending on property size.
- **Earth Check:** Specific to hospitality, this international benchmarking and certification program is based on the Agenda 21 principles of Sustainable Development, providing a framework for managing sustainability programs and monitoring performance and improvement.
- **Green Globes:** The Green Building Initiative's green management program includes an assessment protocol, rating system, and guide for integrating environmentally-friendly design into commercial buildings.
- **Green Seal:** It is a science-based nonprofit organization that focuses exclusively in developing environmental standards, and certifying products and operations since 1989.
- **EcoRooms & EcoSuites:** This is an approval and certification program requiring 100% compliance with eight criteria that are guestroom related. The program requires all guest rooms to be 100% non-smoking.
- **Sustainable tourism Eco-Certification Program (STEP):** This comprehensive, global sustainable tourism eco-certification program is offered by a non-profit organization and aligned with the minimum baseline Global Sustainable Tourism Criteria (GSTC) and impending global accreditation through the Sustainable Tourism Stewardship Council (STSC).
- **US Green Building Council:** The U.S. Green Building Council has decided to not create a separate LEED for Hospitality program. Instead, they have aligned all their market sector ratings (including hospitals and schools) under one system called LEED 2009. They have created a "bookshelf" of credits that apply to all of its diverse rating standards. A new 110-point LEED scorecard gives 100 points plus a possible 10 bonus points, which nearly doubles the optional credits for energy performance. AH&LA is assisting the process in regard to how hotels are unique both for new construction and renovations of existing hotels and an operational program for existing properties.
- **Arizona Hotel & Lodging Association, Certified Green:** A self-certification workbook to become a certified lodging facility.

A section of the survey was specifically aimed at lodging industry respondents, who were asked to select from a list of sustainable lodging practices all those they are using. The highest rate of participation was for the use of water conservation fixtures in guest rooms, indicated by eight of 10 organizations (80.4%). Close behind that, at 79.1%, was the purchase of guest room amenities in bulk, practiced by the vast majority of lodging properties. Linen reuse options were offered to guest rooms in more than three-fourths of properties (78.4%), and housekeeping systems to detect and repair leaking plumbing fixtures were also used by three-fourths (74.3%). Excess furniture and equipment were effectively recycled through donation to local non-profits by fully 70.9% of respondents. Another two-thirds of lodging properties (65.5%) used preventive maintenance schedules to ensure the efficiency of their water-using appliances (ice machines, washing machines, etc.). When it comes to the adoption of refillable amenity dispensers in bathrooms, only about one-third (30.4%) follow this practice, suggesting that a fair amount of opposition to this practice still exists. A much smaller percentage (15.5%) of lodging properties were offering their guests bicycles to use in place of their cars. See the complete responses in Table 38.

**Table 38. Sustainable lodging practices**

	Count	Percent
Water conserving fixtures (low flow showerheads/toilets, toilet-tank diverters and sink aerators) are installed in guest rooms	119	80.4%
Whenever possible guest amenities are purchased in bulk	117	79.1%
A linen reuse option is offered to guest rooms	116	78.4%
Housekeeping and engineering departments have an active system to detect and repair leaking toilets, faucets, and showerheads	110	74.3%
Excess furniture/equipment is donated to local non-profits (such as The Salvation Army or Goodwill)	105	70.9%
Water-using appliances and equipment (ice machines, washing machines, etc) are on a preventive maintenance schedule to ensure maximum efficiency	97	65.5%
Refillable amenity dispensers are used rather than individual bottles for bathroom amenities	45	30.4%
Bicycles are available for use or rental to guests	23	15.5%
None of the Above	5	3.4%

What percentage of respondents in the accommodations sector has a restaurant or eating facility and kitchen that prepares hot food on the premises? Slightly more than two-thirds (68.5%) of the lodging properties that reported had in-house food service facilities preparing hot food, while one-third (31.5%) did not. See Table 39.

**Table 39. Lodging or Camping property has restaurant/eating facility & kitchen that prepares hot food**

	Count	Percent
No	40	31.5%
Yes	87	68.5%
Total	127	100.0%

Next, those properties with such kitchen facilities were asked to further characterize the type of food service facility. Most common were eating places, reported by two-thirds of respondents (66.3%), followed by lodging-place restaurants (59.4%). About half (52.5%) also reported that they had drinking places or bars on the property. Much smaller percentages reported having managed services or retail/vending/recreation or mobile services, both at 13.9%. A very small percentage (4.0%) reported the presence of institutional food service facilities. See Table 40.

**Table 40. Type of food service facility**

	Count	Percent
Eating Place(s)	67	66.3%
Lodging-place Restaurant(s)	60	59.4%
Drinking Place(s)	53	52.5%
Managed Services	14	13.9%
Retail, Vending, Recreation, Mobile	14	13.9%
Institutional Food service	4	4.0%

## Sustainable Restaurant Practices

The most common sustainable restaurant practice is recycling of cardboard, used by fully 86.0% of responding restaurants. Sustainable restaurant practices used by more than half of respondents included the use of Energy Star kitchen equipment (54.0%) and the recycling of cooking oil (54.0%). Further down the list, but still significant, was the use of biodegradable compostable containers for take-away food instead of Styrofoam, a practice of 39.0% of respondent organizations. A positive finding is that only a small minority, less than one in ten organizations, said they used none of these practices (8.0%). See Table 41.

**Table 41. Please list your sustainable restaurant practices?**

	Count	Percent
Recycling of cardboard is practiced	86	86.0%
Energy Star certified kitchen equipment is in use	54	54.0%
Recycling of cooking oil	54	54.0%
Biodegradable compostable containers are used for take-away items instead of Styrofoam	39	39.0%
None of the above	8	8.0%

## Comparison with other sustainability tourism research

How do the findings of this study compare with sustainability research in other states? A similar state-of-the-industry study was conducted by the University of Minnesota for that state in 2007, by Ingrid Schneider, as a joint effort of University Extension, and the College of Food, Agricultural and Natural Resource Sciences. If the findings of that study are compared side-by-side in terms of comparably-worded questions in the Arizona 2011 study, many similarities can be seen. It should also be acknowledged that the difference in time periods between the two studies – 2007 vs. 2011 – could also be significant; the Minnesota industry may have made additional advances since 2007. Nevertheless, the side-by-side comparisons of data from these two studies, shown in Table 42, are instructive, and the two states are comparable on a number of sustainability practices.

On most sustainable practices, the percentage of Arizona tourism organizations engaging in that practice exceeds that of Minnesota (those with “+” in the last column). The sustainable practices on which Arizona falls behind Minnesota are in nine of the 21 measures. These nine are: use of daylight to decrease energy, donation of older materials, buying recycled products, practicing social responsibility, HVAC regularly checked, use of low VOC materials, use of environmentally responsible cleaners, encouraging public transportation, and controlling noise. On the other 12 measures, Arizona’s practices surpass those of Minnesota, in a few cases by large percentages, such as use of compact bulbs, use of energy management systems, native plants or xeriscaping, and purchase of fair trade products. Again, caution should be used given that the Minnesota study was conducted in 2007 and the Arizona study in 2011.

**Table 42. Comparing data from 2007 Minnesota study vs. 2011 Arizona study**

	<b>Minnesota Tourism Study, 2007</b>	<b>Arizona Tourism Study, 2011</b>	<b>Percent Comparison AZ to MN</b>
<b><i>Sustainable Practice</i></b>			
Use daylight	74%*	29%*	-61%
Use compact bulbs	44%	83%	+87%
Use Energy Star appliances	36%	53%	+47%
Use lighting sensors	28%	41%	+46%
Use energy management systems	26%	56%	+115%
Inform customers of energy practices	23%	32%	+39%
Recycling Program	75%	92%	+27%
Donate older materials	74%	55%	-26%
Buy recycled products	57%	48%	-16%
Use native plants/xeriscaping	38%	73%	+92%
Employ local residents	88%	93%	+6
Practice social responsibility	87%	80%	-8%
Promote local businesses	86%	90%	+5%
Buy products locally	81%	82%	+1%
Purchase fair trade products	19%	55%	+189%
US Green Building Council	10%	14%	+4%
HVAC regularly checked	59%	19%	-68%
Use low VOC materials	42%	13%	-69%
Environmentally responsible cleaners	49%	13%	-73%
Encourage public transportation	67%	32%	-52%
Control noise	76%	22%	-71%

\*Percents represent the percent of the sample that has implemented this practice.

Another way to evaluate the Arizona findings is to compare them to a list of the top five sustainable actions that consumers expect the hospitality industry to implement. As shown in Table 43, Arizona’s tourism industry compares well on these five practices – shown in the left column, followed by the percent of the population that expects the industry to implement these, the percent of the Arizona tourism industry that is implementing these practices, and in the far right column the percent of the U.S. industry using this practice. See Table 43.

**Table 43. Public expectations of sustainable practices compared to AZ & US tourism practices**

Sustainable Practice	Percent of public expecting this practice	Percent of AZ tourism using this practice	Percent of US tourism using this practice (2010)
Recycling	77%	92%	60%
Using energy-efficient lighting	74%	87%	88%
Using energy-efficient windows	59%	No data	No data
Towel/linen reuse program	52%	78%	88%
Safe cleaning products	49%	51%	No data

Source: American Hotel & Lodging Association, 2010 Lodging Survey; and, Claudia Jurowski, *Sustainable Hospitality Management: The New Normal Way of Doing Business*. Presentation, Greater Western Travel and Tourism Association, Symposium, Santa Fe, NM, March 2011.

Thus, Arizona tourism appears to exceed expectations on recycling, on use of energy-efficient lighting, and on a towel/linen reuse program. The Arizona tourism industry is right at the average for use of safe cleaning products; no data was available for use of energy-efficient windows.

## Sustainable Practices of DMOs or Destination Marketing Organizations

About two-thirds of Destination Marketing Organizations (62.3%) said that their destination is currently involved in sustainable tourism programs or activities, while the remaining third of DMOs (37.7%) said their community was not involved in sustainable tourism programs. See Table 44.

**Table 44. Is your destination currently involved in any sustainable tourism programs or activities?**

	Count	Percent
No	20	37.7%
Yes	33	62.3%
Total	53	100.0%

Next, DMO respondents were asked to specify the types of sustainable practices that exist in their communities. Most common were cultural and heritage programs (82.4%), followed by art or historic walk programs (79.4%), both of which were practiced by the vast majority. At two-thirds of destinations were bird and wildlife watching programs (67.6%), followed by historic preservation programs (61.8%). About half of DMOs reported that their community had farmers markets (55.9%), ecotourism programs (44.1%), or dark sky programs (44.1%). Four out of ten community DMOs reported locally grown/organic food programs (41.2%), sustainability events (41.2%), or the offering of guided interpretive hikes (41.2%). Further down the list were geotourism programs (38.2%), urban trail systems (29.4%), or indigenous heritage programs (26.5%). Finally, about one in five DMOs reported alternative transportation systems (20.6%), as well as wayfinding signage or green guide programs (both at 17.6%). Only a tiny percentage (2.9%) reported actual carbon offset programs in practice in their community. See Table 45.

**Table 45. What types of sustainable programs is your destination/DMO currently involved in?**

	Count	Percent
Cultural and heritage programs	28	82.4%
Art Walk or Historic Walk	27	79.4%
Bird/wildlife watching	23	67.6%
Historic preservation programs	21	61.8%
Farmers Market	19	55.9%
Ecotourism programs	15	44.1%
Dark Sky programs	15	44.1%
Local grown/organic foods program	14	41.2%
Sustainability events	14	41.2%
Guided interpretive hikes	14	41.2%
Geotourism programs	13	38.2%
Urban trail system	10	29.4%
Indigenous heritage programs	9	26.5%
Alternative transportation	7	20.6%
Wayfinding signage programs	6	17.6%
Green guide to the destination	6	17.6%
Carbon offset program	1	2.9%

DMO respondents were asked if their community allocates specific funds to market or promote sustainable tourism programs and/or activities. It was reported that three-fourths of all communities (74.1%) do *not* provide specific funding for this purpose, while one-fourth of communities (25.9%) do allocate funds to promote sustainable practices locally. See Table 46.

**Table 46. Specific funds allocated to market or promote sustainable tourism programs and/or activities in your community**

	Count	Percent
No	40	74.1%
Yes	14	25.9%
Total	54	100.0%

When asked to rate how well their destination implements sustainable tourism programs, more than half (55.4%) judged their destination to be in the middle – neither good nor bad at promoting these practices. About a third ranked their community either good (30.4%) or very good (5.4%) in implementing sustainable tourism programs, while far fewer rated their community as bad (7.1%) or very bad (1.8%) at implementing such tourism programs. See Table 47.

**Table 47. Overall, how well would you rate your destination in implementing sustainable tourism programs?**

	Very Bad	Bad	Neither Good nor Bad	Good	Very Good	Mean
Overall, how well would you rate your destination in implementing sustainable tourism programs?	1.8%	7.1%	55.4%	30.4%	5.4%	3.3

1 = Very Bad  
5 = Very Good

When DMOs were asked to specify all the challenges that they encounter when developing or promoting sustainable tourism programs in their communities, leading the list were the cost and the time needed. Two-thirds of DMO representatives (66.7%) identified the cost of developing sustainable tourism programs as the biggest challenge. Also high on the list of challenges, identified by 58.3% of respondents, was the time required to develop these programs. Further down the list were a host of other issues: lack of expertise in marketing such programs (37.5%), lack of understanding about how it would benefit the community (33.3%), lack of interest by the community (31.3%), the fact that such programs were never considered (29.2%), lack of interest within the destination (29.2%), to being unsure how to develop such programs (27.1%). At the bottom of the list of challenges were: disagreement about how to implement such programs (10.4%) or “other” issues (10.4%). See Table 48.

**Table 48. Primary challenges encountered in developing or promoting sustainable tourism programs in destinations**

	Count	Percent
The cost involved to develop a sustainable tourism program	32	66.7%
The time involved to develop a sustainable tourism program	28	58.3%
Lack of expertise in marketing a sustainable tourism program	18	37.5%
Lack of understanding about how a sustainable tourism approach would benefit the destination	16	33.3%
Lack of interest from local community in a sustainable tourism program	15	31.3%
Never considered a sustainable tourism program	14	29.2%
Lack of interest within the destination in a sustainable tourism program	14	29.2%
Unsure how to develop a sustainable tourism program	13	27.1%
Disagreement about how to develop a sustainable tourism program	5	10.4%
Other:	5	10.4%

DMOs were asked about the likelihood that their destination would adopt sustainable tourism programs in the next 12 months. In general, about a third thought it was either likely (24.5%) or very likely (7.5%) they would do so; about a third (39.6%) were undecided; and the remaining third thought it was unlikely (18.9%) or very unlikely (9.4%) that new sustainable tourism programs would be adopted in the next year. See Table 49.

**Table 49. Likelihood your destination will adopt sustainable tourism programs in next 12 months**

	Very Unlikely	Unlikely	Undecided	Likely	Very Likely	Mean
What is the likelihood your destination will adopt and/or implement sustainable tourism programs in the next 12 months?	9.4%	18.9%	39.6%	24.5%	7.5%	3.0

1 = Very Unlikely

5 = Very Likely

When the time horizon for implementing sustainable tourism programs was pushed further out – from 12 to 24 months – DMOs were slightly more positive about the likelihood of implementing programs. Under this scenario, about four in 10 thought it was likely (26.9%) or very likely (11.5%) they would adopt or implement sustainable programs, while four in 10 (40.4%) were undecided, and only 20% thought it either unlikely (13.5%) or very unlikely (7.7%) they would do so. See Table 50.

**Table 50. Likelihood your destination will adopt and/or implement sustainable tourism programs within the next 12 - 24 months**

	Very Unlikely	Unlikely	Undecided	Likely	Very Likely	Mean
What is the likelihood your destination will adopt and/or implement sustainable tourism programs within the next 12 - 24 months	7.7%	13.5%	40.4%	26.9%	11.5%	3.2

1 = Very Unlikely  
5 = Very Likely

Do most representatives of DMOs think that they have the knowledge, information or resources necessary to implement sustainable tourism programs in their communities? Interestingly, one-fourth said they did have the needed skills and information (22.2%), one-fourth said they did not (27.8%), while fully one-half were not sure whether they did or did not (50.0%). This suggests that DMOs believe they need more assistance in all aspects of implementing sustainable tourism practices in their communities. See Table 51.

**Table 51. Do you feel you have the knowledge/information/resources to implement a sustainable tourism program in your destination?**

	Count	Percent
Yes	12	22.2%
No	15	27.8%
Not Sure	27	50.0%
Total	54	100.0%

When asked whether the implementation of sustainable tourism programs will make their destination more competitive or better able to attract or retain visitors, almost half (43.4%) said that such programs would have that effect, while very few said it would not (9.4%). Quite a large percentage of respondents, however, (47.2%) were not sure whether their destination would be more competitive with such programs – again, perhaps an opportunity for more education on these issues. See Table 52.

**Table 52. Will your destination become more competitive (i.e., greater ability to retain or attract visitors) with the implementation of sustainable tourism programs?**

	Count	Percent
Yes	23	43.4%
No	5	9.4%
Not Sure	25	47.2%
Total	53	100.0%

DMO respondents were next asked to indicate the kinds of sustainable programs or opportunities that exist in their destination. At the top of this list was historic tourism (86.3%), followed by state and national parks (70.6%) and adventure tourism (68.6%). About half of DMOs (56.9%) identified the arts/fine arts/art walks as available programs in their community. Practiced in fewer than half of communities were agricultural tourism (43.1%), scenic rivers and lakes (41.2%), and ecotourism (41.2%), indigenous tourism (41.2%). The three lowest offerings pertained to more location-specific types of tourism: geographic wonders (39.2%), wine tourism (31.4%), and alpine tourism (only 11.8%). See Table 53.

**Table 53. Which of the following sustainable programs or opportunities exists for your destination?**

	Count	Percent
Historic Tourism	44	86.3%
Access to State and National Parks Tourism	36	70.6%
Adventure Tourism	35	68.6%
Art Galleries/Fine Art Tourism/First Fridays	29	56.9%
Agricultural Tourism	22	43.1%
Scenic Rivers & Lakes Tourism	21	41.2%
Indigenous Tourism	21	41.2%
Ecotourism	21	41.2%
Geographic Wonders Tourism	20	39.2%
Wine Tourism	16	31.4%
Alpine Tourism	6	11.8%

One of the last questions asked respondents to indicate ways the Arizona Office of Tourism could assist them in implementing sustainable tourism approaches and practices. The most important methods respondents identified were for AOT to provide marketing materials (66.4%) or how-to guides (59.6%). These were followed by educational seminars or programs (55.4%) and networking opportunities (54.3%). Fewer than half of respondents identified AOT sharing articles with them (43.6%), research reports/white papers (29.3%), or case studies (25.7%) as being of assistance. Some other methods were listed; see the full list of other responses in the appendix. See Table 54.

**Table 54. How can the Arizona Office of Tourism assist you in implementing sustainable tourism approaches and tourism?**

	Count	Percent
Marketing Materials	186	66.4%
How-to Guides	167	59.6%
Educational Seminars & Programs	155	55.4%
Networking Opportunities	152	54.3%
Articles	122	43.6%
Research Reports/White Papers	82	29.3%
Case Studies	72	25.7%
Other:	36	12.9%

A final question asked respondents to indicate the total number of years they have worked in the tourism industry, and the number of years they have worked in their current organization. The average of all respondents for total years worked was 17 years and the median was 15; the average for number of years in their current organization was 10 years and the median was eight (8) years. See Table 55.

**Table 55. Number of years working in the tourism industry and for your organization**

	Mean	Median
How many years have you worked in the tourism industry?	17	15
How many years have you worked in this organization?	10	8

Finally, the survey offered respondents an opportunity to suggest what they thought would be the next best steps to promote sustainable tourism in Arizona. Many suggestions were offered for these next steps, and they are listed in full-text in Appendix B. Among the most mentioned were comments in categories such as the following:

- More advertising of Arizona's natural attractions
- Better communication of the Arizona story, including cultural and historic attractions
- Education of visitors and residents about ways to protect and conserve Arizona's special places
- Maintaining the land, parks and other features of Arizona's unique landscapes
- More promotion of Arizona's sustainability efforts and ecotourism.

## **Appendix A: Copy of Survey Instrument**

**(Note: The online format viewed by respondents as they completed the survey appeared as a series of screens. The text provided here reflects the same content of the survey in a document based format.)**



SUSTAINABLE TOURISM SURVEY We appreciate your input!

This survey is being conducted for the Arizona Office of Tourism by the Arizona Hospitality Research & Resource Center at Northern Arizona University. Its purpose is to acquire baseline data on sustainable practices in Arizona's travel and tourism industry. Your participation is requested in this effort to help the Arizona Office of Tourism gain information to design future programs and marketing initiatives based on sustainability practices. As an added bonus, the Arizona Hospitality Research & Resource Center survey will measure and score your organization's individual sustainability progress. These scores are for your own personal knowledge and will remain confidential. The first section of the survey is general and the second part is specific to your industry sector.

In what county is your tourism organization located?

- Apache County
- Cochise County
- Coconino County
- Gila County
- Graham County
- Greenlee County
- La Paz County
- Maricopa County
- Mohave County
- Navajo County
- Pima County
- Pinal County
- Santa Cruz County
- Yavapai County
- Yuma County

Are you a tribal entity or located on Tribal land?

- Yes
- No

## KNOWLEDGE OF SUSTAINABILITY

The Arizona Office of Tourism defines Sustainable Tourism as: "Sustaining the culture, heritage and environment of a region while at the same time promoting economic growth and social wellbeing through tourism."

How much do you currently know about sustainable practices? Mark only one.

- I recognize terms or buzz words, but I don't have a full understanding of the issues.
- I know what I hear on the news or read in mainstream media.
- I seek out information on environmental and social issues of concern.

How would you define sustainability?

What, in your opinion, are the next best steps for sustainable tourism in Arizona?

## SUSTAINABILITY STRATEGY

Has your organization developed a comprehensive sustainability strategy?

- Yes
- No, but in the process of doing so
- No current plan

What are the driving factors behind your organization's sustainability initiatives? Mark all that apply.

- Cost Reduction/Efficiency Improvement
- Corporate Image/Brand Reputation
- Community Environmental Concern
- End-Consumer Environmental Concerns/Pressure From Customers
- Employee Interests
- Government Compliance
- Supply Chain Pressure/Interest
- Investors
- Others (list here): \_\_\_\_\_

Does your organization have a person responsible for implementing sustainable strategies?

- Yes
- No

To what extent has your organization communicated its sustainability goals and policies across the organization?

- To a great extent
- To a limited extent
- Not at all

If Not at all Is Selected, Then Skip To To what extent has your organization communicated its sustainability goals and policies to external stakeholders?

How does your organization internally communicate its sustainability goals and policies?

- Company Intranet
- New Employee Orientation
- Posters in Workplace
- Emails from Senior Managers to Employees
- Employee Training in Sustainable Operations
- Performance Evaluations
- Other (list here): \_\_\_\_\_

To what extent has your organization communicated its sustainability goals and policies to external stakeholders?

- To a great extent
- To a limited extent
- Not at all

If Not at all Is Selected, Then Skip To How successful has your organization been in engaging stakeholders in sustainability strategies/initiatives?

How has your organization gone about engaging external stakeholders?

- Influence social or environmental practices
- Create more sustainable products or services
- Suggest non-profits or other groups to partner with
- Identify sustainability goals or targets
- Develop marketing (including social marketing) approaches
- Provide feedback on reports or press releases
- Test advertising campaigns
- Other \_\_\_\_\_

How successful has your organization been in engaging stakeholders in sustainability strategies/initiatives?

- Successful
- Somewhat Successful
- Somewhat Unsuccessful
- Unsuccessful
- Not Sure

What are the significant barriers that your organization faces in developing and implementing sustainable strategies and practices?

- Availability of funds/Prioritization of funds
- Cost/Perceived lack of return on investment
- Complexity of implementation
- Lack of staff
- Lack of adequate sustainability-related education/training
- No significant business driver
- Senior management indifference
- Other (list here): \_\_\_\_\_

## ENVIRONMENT

Is your organization currently implementing any Waste Reduction measures?

- Yes
- No

If No Is Selected, Then Skip To Is your organization currently implementing any water conservation measures?

What waste reduction measures are currently being implemented by your organization?

- A recycling program to collect recyclables from staff and customers
- Procedures in place to reduce use of materials wherever possible
- A policy exists to buy products that contain recycled materials or are made from renewable sources
- Collect and compost materials including kitchen and/or landscaping wastes
- Reusable or biodegradable dishes and utensils
- Donation of used items
- Other waste reduction measures (list here): \_\_\_\_\_

Is your organization currently implementing any water conservation measures?

- Yes
- No

If No Is Selected, Then Skip To Is your organization currently implementing any measures to reduce energy usage?

What water conservation measures are currently being implemented by your organization?

- Low-flow or dual flush toilets
- Faucet aerators
- Sink motion sensors
- Low-flow showerheads
- Signage asking customers to minimize water usage
- Toilet dams
- Other interior water management systems
- Native plants used in landscaping
- Xeriscape
- Gray water irrigation
- Rainwater collection
- Minimize the use of artificial fertilizers and toxic pest and weed control

Is your organization currently implementing any measures to reduce energy usage?

- Yes
- No

If No Is Selected, Then Skip To Does your organization monitor energy and water consumption to determine effects of conservation?

What energy efficiency measures are currently being implemented by your organization?

- Low energy lighting (solar, compact fluorescent, LED)
- Encourage staff and customers to turn off lights
- Motion sensors to control lighting
- Improved insulation to minimize heating/cooling loss
- Utilize daylight/passive solar
- Energy Star/Energy efficient equipment
- Encouraging staff and customers to rideshare, bicycle or use public transportation
- Alternative fuel vehicles (e.g. hybrids, biodiesel, electric, E85)
- Renewable energy system (e.g. solar, wind, biomass, thermal)
- Other energy efficiency measures (list here): \_\_\_\_\_

Does your organization monitor energy and water consumption to determine effects of conservation?

- Yes
- No

Is your organization currently implementing any Air Quality measures?

- Yes
- No

If No Is Selected, Then Skip To Is all or part of your organization located in a LEED Certified Building or building that is seeking LEED certification?

What air quality measures are currently being implemented by your organization?

- Indoor air quality management system in use
- Environmentally responsible cleaners are used
- Low VOC (Volatile Organic Compound) paint, adhesives, carpeting, air fresheners or other materials are used
- HVAC system is regularly maintained and all mold, bacteria and air flow obstructions removed
- Vehicle emissions are reduced through use of alternative fuel vehicles and/or rideshare options
- Reduced emissions from fireplaces and incinerators
- Other air quality measures \_\_\_\_\_

Is all or part of your organization located in a LEED Certified Building or building that is seeking LEED certification?

- Yes
- No

#### SOCIAL/CULTURAL

Is your organization currently implementing any Noise Reduction measures?

- Yes
- No

If No Is Selected, Then Skip To Does your organization have a purchase policy that favors products that are fair-trade, locally sourced, free of child labor, do not exploit the environment and/or organic?

What noise reduction measures are currently being implemented by your organization?

- Engaged with neighbors on possible noise issues
- Enforce quiet hours or a reduced noise ordinance
- Use low noise equipment
- Other noise reduction practices (list here): \_\_\_\_\_

Does your organization have a purchase policy that favors products that are fair-trade, locally sourced, free of child labor, do not exploit the environment and/or are organic?

- Yes
- No

Does your organization actively celebrate and promote local culture? For example, through protection of local historic sites, use of local art, or participation in cultural events.

- Yes
- No

Does your organization value quality of customer experience over quantity of customers?

- Yes
- No

Does your organization educate customers of your region's unique socio-cultural landscape?

- Yes
- No

Does your organization provide learning opportunities for locals? For example through mentoring or apprenticeships.

- Yes
- No

Do you and/or someone in your organization participate on community committees or councils?

- Yes
- No

## ECONOMIC

Does your organization source supplies locally to support your local community?

- Yes
- No

Does your organization participate in any partnerships with other local businesses to encourage the economic benefits of tourism spin-off to the entire local economy?

- Yes
- No

Does your organization have a long-term financial plan to ensure your own economic sustainability?

- Yes
- No

Does your organization support charitable organizations through donations either financially or in-kind?

- Yes
- No

Does your organization encourage employee volunteerism through paid volunteer time or participation in fundraising activities such as walk-a-thons, bake sales or silent auctions?

- Yes
- No

Does your organization hire people from the local community?

- Yes
- No

With what industry sector are you primarily affiliated? Mark only one. Note: If you are a lodging/camping establishment which also has restaurant operations, select Accommodations below.

- Accommodations (Hotel/Motel, Resort, B&B, RV Park, Campground)
- Restaurant/Eating & Drinking Place
- Convention Visitor's Bureau/Destination Marketing Organization
- Attraction-Public
- Attraction-Private
- Attraction-Non-profit
- Other \_\_\_\_\_

If Accommodations Is Selected, Then Skip To INDUSTRY SECTOR QUESTIONS-Accommodations. If Restaurant/Eating & Drinking Is Selected, Then Skip To INDUSTRY SECTOR QUESTIONS-Restaurant & Food Service. If Convention Visitor's Bureau/DMO Is Selected, Then Skip To INDUSTRY SECTOR QUESTIONS- Destination Marketing Organizations. If Attraction-Public Is Selected, Then Skip To How can the Arizona Office of Tourism...If Attraction-Private Is Selected, Then Skip To How can the Arizona Office of Tourism assist you in implementing sustainable tourism approaches and tourism? If Attraction-Non-profit Is Selected, Then Skip To How can the Arizona Office of Tourism assist you in implementing sustainable tourism approaches and tourism? If Other Is Selected, Then Skip To How can the Arizona Office of Tourism assist you in implementing sustainable tourism approaches and tourism?

## INDUSTRY SECTOR QUESTIONS-Accommodations

### Type of Lodging Property

- Hotel/Motel/Historic Inn
- Resort
- Bed & Breakfast
- Campground
- RV Park
- Other (list here): \_\_\_\_\_

If Hotel/Motel/Historic Inn Is Selected, Then Skip To How many rooms does your property have? If Resort Is Selected, Then Skip To How many rooms does your property have? If Bed & Breakfast Is Selected, Then Skip To How many rooms does your property have? If Campground Is Selected, Then Skip To How many camp/RV sites does your property have? If RV Park Is Selected, Then Skip To How many camp/RV sites does your property have? If Other (list here): Is Selected, Then Skip To How many rooms does your property have?

### How many rooms does your property have?

- 0 to 25 rooms
- 26 to 50 rooms
- 51 to 100 rooms
- 101 to 200 rooms
- 201 to 300 rooms
- 301 to 400 rooms
- 401 to 500 rooms
- 500+ rooms

### How many camp/RV sites does your property have?

- 0 thru 100 sites
- 101 thru 249 sites
- 250 thru 499 sites
- 500+ sites

### Number of employees during peak season (full-time & part-time if applicable)

- Full-time \_\_\_\_\_
- Part-time \_\_\_\_\_

### When is the property open?

- Year-round
- Seasonally

If Year-round Is Selected, Then Skip To What is the legal ownership of your property?

If Seasonally, mark all months you are open:

- January
- February
- March
- April
- May
- June
- July
- August
- September
- October
- November
- December

What is the legal ownership of your property?

- Company (Ltd)
- Partnership
- Solo Trade
- Family Trust
- Government/Public
- Other (list here): \_\_\_\_\_

Please check all of the following sustainable lodging practices used at your facility.

- A linen reuse option is offered to guest rooms
- Water conserving fixtures (low flow showerheads/toilets, toilet-tank diverters and sink aerators) are installed in guest rooms.
- Housekeeping and engineering departments have an active system to detect and repair leaking toilets, faucets, and showerheads.
- Refillable amenity dispensers are used rather than individual bottles for bathroom amenities.
- Whenever possible guest amenities are purchased in bulk.
- Bicycles are available for use or rental to guests
- Water-using appliances and equipment (ice machines, washing machines, etc.) are on a preventive maintenance schedule to ensure maximum efficiency.
- Excess furniture/equipment is donated to local non-profits (such as The Salvation Army or Goodwill)
- None of the Above

Does your Lodging or Camping property have a restaurant or eating facility with a kitchen that prepares hot food in-house?

- Yes
- No

If Yes Is Selected, Then Skip To INDUSTRY SECTOR QUESTIONS-Restaurant & Food Service. If No Is Selected, Then Skip To How can the Arizona Office of Tourism assist you in implementing sustainable tourism approaches and tourism?

## INDUSTRY SECTOR QUESTIONS-Restaurant & Food Service

Type of Restaurant/Foodservice Operation. Mark all that apply.

- Eating Place(s)
- Drinking Place(s)
- Managed Services
- Lodging-place Restaurant(s)
- Retail, Vending, Recreation, Mobile
- Institutional Foodservice

Number of employees during peak season

- Full-time \_\_\_\_\_
- Part-time \_\_\_\_\_

When is the property open?

- Year-round
- Seasonally

If Year-round Is Selected, Then Skip To What is the legal ownership of your property?

If Seasonally, check all months you are open:

- January
- February
- March
- April
- May
- June
- July
- August
- September
- October
- November
- December

What is the legal ownership of your property?

- Company (Ltd)
- Partnership
- Solo Trade
- Family Trust
- Government/Public
- Other (list here): \_\_\_\_\_

Mark all of the following sustainable practices used at your facility:

- Energy Star certified kitchen equipment is in use
- Recycling of cooking oil
- Recycling of cardboard is practiced
- Biodegradable compostable containers are used for take-away items instead of styrofoam
- None of the above

If Energy Star certified kitchen Is Selected, Then Skip To How can the Arizona Office of Tourism assist you in implementing sustainable tourism approaches and tourism? If Recycling of cooking oil Is Selected, Then Skip To How can the Arizona Office of Tourism assist you in implementing sustainable tourism approaches and tourism? If Recycling of cardboard is practiced Is Selected, Then Skip To How can the Arizona Office of Tourism assist you in implementing sustainable tourism approaches and tourism? If Biodegradable compostable containers... Is Selected, Then Skip To How can the Arizona Office of Tourism assist you in implementing sustainable tourism approaches and tourism? If None of the above Is Selected, Then Skip To How can the Arizona Office of Tourism assist you in implementing sustainable tourism approaches and tourism?

INDUSTRY SECTOR QUESTIONS-Destination Marketing Organizations

Is your destination currently involved in any sustainable tourism programs or activities?

- Yes
- No

If No Is Selected, Then Skip To Do you have specific funds allocated to market or promote sustainable tourism programs and/or activities in your community?

What types of sustainable programs is your destination/DMO currently involved in? Mark all that apply.

- Farmers Market
- Local grown/organic foods program
- Cultural and heritage programs
- Sustainability events
- Geotourism programs
- Ecotourism programs
- Dark Sky programs
- Bird/wildlife watching
- Guided interpretive hikes
- Indigenous heritage programs
- Historic preservation programs
- Art Walk or Historic Walk
- Urban trail system
- Wayfinding signage programs
- Alternative transportation
- Green guide to the destination
- Carbon offset program

Do you have specific funds allocated to market or promote sustainable tourism programs and/or activities in your community?

- Yes
- No

Overall, how well would you rate your destination in implementing sustainable tourism programs?

- Very Bad
- Bad
- Neither Good nor Bad
- Good
- Very Good

What are the primary challenges you have encountered in developing or promoting sustainable tourism programs for your destination? Mark all that apply.

- Never considered a sustainable tourism program for our destination/organization
- Lack of expertise in marketing a sustainable tourism program
- Lack of understanding about how a sustainable tourism approach would benefit the destination
- Disagreement about how to develop a sustainable tourism program
- Unsure how to develop a sustainable tourism program
- Lack of interest within the destination in a sustainable tourism program
- Lack of interest from local community in a sustainable tourism program
- The time involved to develop a sustainable tourism program
- The cost involved to develop a sustainable tourism program
- Other: \_\_\_\_\_

What is the likelihood your destination will adopt and/or implement sustainable tourism programs in the next 12 months?

- Very Unlikely
- Unlikely
- Undecided
- Likely
- Very Likely

What is the likelihood your destination will adopt and/or implement sustainable tourism programs within the next 12 - 24 months.

- Very Unlikely
- Unlikely
- Undecided
- Likely
- Very Likely

Do you feel you have the knowledge/information/resources to implement a sustainable tourism program in your destination?

- Yes
- No
- Not Sure

Do you feel your destination will become more competitive (i.e. greater ability to retain or attract visitors) with the implementation of sustainable tourism programs?

- Yes
- No
- Not Sure

Which of the following sustainable programs or opportunities exists for your destination? Mark all that apply.

- Agricultural Tourism
- Wine Tourism
- Adventure Tourism
- Scenic Rivers & Lakes Tourism
- Indigenous Tourism
- Geographic Wonders Tourism
- Alpine Tourism
- Access to State and National Parks Tourism
- Art Galleries/Fine Art Tourism/First Fridays
- Historic Tourism
- Ecotourism

How can the Arizona Office of Tourism assist you in implementing sustainable tourism approaches and tourism? Mark all that apply.

- Marketing Materials
- How-to Guides
- Networking Opportunities
- Educational Seminars & Programs
- Research Reports/White Papers
- Articles
- Case Studies
- Other: \_\_\_\_\_

How many years have you worked in the tourism industry?

How many years have you worked in this organization?

Provide your position/title in the business/organization.

## **Appendix B: Open-ended Comments and Lists of “Other” Responses**

## How would you define sustainability?

Promotion through responsibility.....

new buzz word with little meaning

the ability to maintain and grow tourism rather than depleting visitors to the area.

"the ability to meet the needs of the present without compromising the ability of future generations to meet their own needs."

"To hold my own" and if possible prosper

A balance between economic growth and the environmental and social concerns. Without economic growth you will not have the ability to sustain a community.

a lasting and continuous growth

A practice that is able to go on indefinitely because it protects the resources that it uses.

A practice that promotes economic, environmental, and business well being. Business practices that promote long term productivity without compromising the future of the environment, or future generations.

A practice that requires little new resources after having been set up and one that produces little waste.

A process or practice employed by businesses and organizations to maximize economic growth while minimizing environmental and negative social impact.

A process that economically and environmentally supports business allowing it to grow and sustain the well being of the inhabitants of the community/region and the business.

A program that becomes established, able to survive and thrive, to endure, and stand on its own especially when there is a change in overseers/managers and/or when outside funding has expired.

A sustainable tourism activity is designed to continue by means not impacting the community or environment in a way that could jeopardize its future continuation.

a system that can sustain or grow on available and re-generating resources vs. exhausting those resources to a point of no return.

Ability to continue with present values.

Ability to maintain soundness of ones operational, financial or healthy existence or business. practices.

Ability to support itself without need of outside intervention or resources.

Able to be maintained

## How would you define sustainability? (continued)

able to keep/maintain

Absence of environmental degradation of any kind, with economic and social growth.

Absence of harm to the environment and other resources, or adequate trade-offs for harms.

Achieving an objective in a manner which has minimal negative impact on the environment whilst using the least natural resources to do so.

agree with the definition above

allocate and leverage economic development resources to sustain and enhance the economic growth, vitality, and global competitiveness of Santa Cruz County as a superior tourism/ business location.

Always putting back into the environment/system as much or more than you take from it.

An activity that may be economically and socially continued, indefinitely, in harmony with protection of the environment.

An organization that is able to sustain itself being financially responsible.

Anything that can be maintained on a long term basis.

Apache Trail Tours: Guided tours in a very historic area that share the history, legends and lore of the area with people from all over the world.

Applying practices in current time that will ensure future generations will enjoy similar benefits

As a company, we have set large goals on reduction of water and power. It is a large part of our goals personally and as a hotel

As a long term use of resources by wisely using them.

As a practice, sustainability is something that does not deplete resources, but regenerates as it functions.

attempting to limit our actions to those that do not jeopardize the resources available to future generations.

Balancing the protection of cultural and natural resources with economic growth, the process of staying economically viable, keeping a steady course in a rough sea.

Be Hopi

Be sustainable in everyday life. Live the most efficient way you can, and use all resources.

being a green hotel that has programs in place to save the environment.

## How would you define sustainability? (continued)

Being able to carryout an experience (travel) without depleting the infrastructure that supports it.

Being able to endure over time, to increase economic development in an environmentally sound manor.

being able to maintain

Being able to maintain our Towns, Citys etc. (environment) for economical and social growth.

Being efficient, recycling, not wasting, not polluting

Being energy sufficient, conserving water & recycling

Being good stewards of resources. Eliminating wasteful habits in regards to energy consumption and establishing means and methods to capture resources that are sustainable.

Being resourceful

Best practices for life on this planet.

Bridging economic development into long term viability while preserving culture, heritage, and resources.

Building and operating with energy efficiency, low water use and low emissions as a primary goal.

capable of being maintained at a steady level without exhausting natural resources

Carry forward and honor the culture and heritage of the southwest while operating in a manner which preserves the environment.

Conducting business and life in a way that does not deplete resources.

Conducting your business, as much as is possible and practical, without adversely impacting the environment or regional culture and heritage.

constantly recurring

CONTINIOUS RETURNING OF TOURIST

Continued practice

continuing into the future at a constant value

Continuous -- able to maintain over time without negative impact.

create a useful product using renewable resources

## How would you define sustainability? (continued)

Creating a system that respects and sustains the history and culture of any given area.

Creating re-newable sources of energy and maintaining our existing natural environments and assets.

Development of assets that have interest and strength of market demand, which does not hinder the natural resources of the area

Doing business in a way that is good for the environment both today and for the future.

Doing our part to preserve the environment through conservation and use of eco-friendly products, eco-consciousness in purchasing decisions and in long-term team practices in all areas of the resort.

Doing the right thing by using products that are produced locally. Also, preserving our natural and native cultures and environment. Education our visitors about the environment, culture, and heritage of our area.

Doing things in a way that have a small impact on the environment. It's about eliminating waste and increasing energy efficiency.

Ecological sustainability describes how biological systems remain diverse and productive over time. Long-lived and healthy wetlands and forests are examples of sustainable biological systems. For humans, sustainability is the potential for long-term maintenance of well being, which has environmental, economic, and social dimensions. Humans have the greatest potential to make the earth (from local landscape to worldwide) unsustainable. Examples are desertification, air pollution, species loss, etc.

Ecologically sound practices

Economic and social progress without sacrificing our history, culture or natural resources.

educating public and providing opportunities to get involved

Encouraging social and business practices that serve to engage the larger community in appreciating regional richness and diversity.

Endurance

Ensuring that a resource, culture, heritage, etc. is around indefinitely. Taking steps so that no part of the environment is destroyed.

Equal balance between people, resources and nature.

Exactly the way AOT has defined it.

Finding a way to create something from what is already there.

## How would you define sustainability? (continued)

For the Hotel Vendome sustainability is about causing the least harm to our environment as possible including conserving water and energy throughout the hotel. We have installed some low flow showerheads and are working to improve our toilets over the next few years. We try to upcycle and improve items instead of throwing them out and replacing them, such as old furniture and artwork. We recycle and encourage guests to do so as well. We have plans to start a compost site at our building for our garden. We hope that our vigilance about these things will help our business and the environment in the long run.

forms of progress that meet the needs of the present without compromising the ability of future generations to meet their needs.

Having a system, enterprise that has the ability to produce what it can sustain itself on.

Having as small an impact on the environment as possible while providing modern conveniences for our guests as a Bed & Breakfast. Conserving water, recycling, protecting wildlife, and providing habitat for wildlife.

having enough business coming in to my restaurant to sustain staying open and profitable

having practices in place that conserve energy and the environment.

Having the infrastructure in place as drivers to your marketplace: Events, marketing, attractions, lodging, restaurants and labor force.

Helping those who visit our area and state understand the cultures, heritage and environments we live and operate our businesses in. And also simultaneously promote the importance of maintaining them.

Here in the Northeast Arizona, I would say being able to care for your land, culture and family by being able to this solely on your own. To sustain your way of life, by keeping your culture close to your heart.

How biological systems remain diverse and productive over time. Endurance

How to be environmentally conscious

Human use has little environmental impact on lands being utilized.

I agree with the AOT's definition of sustainability. But would also add allowing for change to meet societies needs and wants without compromising integrity.

I am new to the hospitality field, so I do not know how to define this.

I define as the ability to adapt to ever changing economic and environmental effects to our community. To use the land and resources in a very conscientious way that promotes the beauty without destroying for generations to come.

## How would you define sustainability? (continued)

I define sustainability as consciousness of the effect of all day-to-day endeavors on the natural environment and ensuring that all practices are minimally invasive/destructive to the environment.

I don't no

I like the AOT definition.

I think of Sustainable tourism much like geo tourism, it improves a residents quality of live and provides a sense of place / it also celebrates the people, the environment, local crafts and local foods.

I would define sustainability as a means to keep people coming back to the area of interest, in our case, Alamo Lake State park, by keeping the park open to the public, keeping the public informed, and providing them with the best customer service as possible.

I would define sustainability as living in such a way as to leave the earth as it is when I find it.

I would define sustainability as the practice of reducing our impact on an area, and in this case, it would be tourism. Sustainable tourism is important to help reduce impacts on specific regions and to continue to promote tourism.

I would define sustainability as zero impact, which seems impossible at this point.

I'm not sure how sustainability relates to tourism.

Improving our environment for the next generation.

In hospitality business to be able to maintain/operate during the season Highs & Lows

In our industry it's implementing business practices that conserve the environment and natural assets of the community for future generations.

In the I-19 corridor from Sahuarita to Nogales The Green Valley Sahuarita Chamber & Visitor Center has organized a Tourism coalition. Working together to promote commerce & tourism. We meet monthly. We encourage each community in the corridor to retain their culture and image. This is what makes Arizona unique.

In Yuma County we make every effort to keep our agriculture alive and thriving as well as growing and attracting new business with interfering with agricultural land

Insuring that the resources that we have today are available in the future, for our children, grandchildren, and so on; that they are protected and even improved where possible, so that we do not deplete the quality of life for all of us.

Introducing the traveling public to places of interest that won't be harmed by having people visit them, while at the same time enhancing their travel experience and understanding of our region.

## How would you define sustainability? (continued)

It is a balance of nature and economic development. To develop the local economy in such a way that it doesn't destroy the very sense of place that made it attractive....and for the host community to enjoy economic development while maintaining and nourishing the natural elements.

It is reducing negative human impact on our environment.

It is the ability to merge economy and ecology into a single system. Also living within the resources of our state, country world without damaging the environment. Making sure we have a planet and resources to leave to our grandchildren.

It is the enjoyment and use of our natural resources in a way that does not deplete them in their entirety and allows natural processes to continue for the benefit of people and wildlife. Related to tourism, it is a method of traveling and recreating in a way that minimizes our impact to the environment via our methods of transportation, consumption of resources, and activities that we engage in while learning and recreating.

It means to support or to provide for.

Just as you did.

Keep in existence or maintain

Keeping C, H and E viable,

Keeping our land and heritage in place.

Keeping something "as is".

Keeping something going.

keeping the same or increasing our level of business and level of attendance over time.

Know nothing about it.

Leading a frugal lifestyle in all aspects. Through being aware of where our resources come from and attempting to be more efficient with the energy and resources we do have, we are less likely to negatively impact our environment and work towards improving what does exist.

Leave no trace. Take only pictures, leave only tracks.

Leaving little to no carbon footprint of our existence on this earth. We recycle, conserve water, eliminate water waste, car pool, build green, use green cleaning products, solar power, rammed earth buildings, low voc paints, etc. and many other things everyday at Miraval. We have won several national awards for our eco friendly and green initiatives.

Leaving something for the next generation

## How would you define sustainability? (continued)

Little impact on the environment, replenishable

living in a way that can be continued into the future in perpetuity.

Living within your means, being aware of the community/region you live in and how your choices can make an impact.

Living, working and playing where you reside. We used to have a B&B in Elgin Arizona, but are now focused on our B&B in Tucson, in the sustainable community of Civano!

Long term continuous economic growth

Low impact to the environment and local culture.

Low or zero impact on the native surrounding environment. Use of locally-gleaned resources as much as possible. Preservation of and education about the local history and historic architecture.

maintain

Maintain things as they are to ensure for the future.

Maintaining a balance

Maintaining a high respect for the environment, heritage and culture while promoting our area.

Maintaining a profitable business.

Maintaining and preserving

Maintaining and rejuvenating the eco-system by limiting the impact to the environment.

Maintaining or increasing what you are monitoring

Maintaining the culture and social beat of the main attractions of Arizona. Regional Parks, City Sports Complex, Family Entertainment, and Tourist attractions.

Maintaining the cultures and historical character of an area and helping visitors or tourists understand the unique appeal of the area's culture and history in order to enrich the tourism experience.

Maintaining the historical and local culture, business should enhance and compliment this.

Maintaining the individuality of Arizona while promoting our diverse cultures. Bringing and maintaining economic growth to Phoenix and the Valley of the Sun.

Maintaining what is here, at the same time allowing for "smart" growth to support the area.

## How would you define sustainability? (continued)

Making sure you meet the needs of the present and making sure you do not compromise the ability of the future so they will be able to meet their needs.

Managing resources wisely.

Managing the resource so that its attractive qualities are not depleted over time

Meeting the immediate needs of the present for a principle entity with a "big picture" perspective that includes aspects of interconnectedness with other interdependent entities, future generations and the long term well being of the principle entity. Determining if the benefits, results or consequences of current actions be in the best interest of both immediate and long term needs for all entities involved. Once the the full effect of the actions are understood, purposefully acting with the appropriate effort or restraint to effect the needs for the greater good of all entities.

Methods used to increase or at least maintain the current levels of tourism in a specific area.

My take would be that people would want to come back.

Not tapping tomorrow's resources. Living with means organizationally. Utilizing local and available resources.

Not using up more resources than can be re-generated

Off the grid

Operating in a way that allows for the business, its community, and the natural environment (immediately surrounding the business and regionally and globally) to thrive into the future.

Our economic base is totally tourism. I work with the lodging/dining/retail to see what their needs are/how we can better serve them. present them with issues, taxes, new local laws or propositions, etc, that that will concern/effect their business. Keep close personal contact. I seek out what other communities are doing to see what can be added to our town's tool box.

Over all goal to reduce carbon foot print not only in recycling but cost reduction in such areas of natural gas & water. But also add sustainability by participating in Green Events ie planting a tree's and gardens.

Practical measures for future growth and sustainability of life that take in to consideration the full impact and consequences of man's actions on himself and the environment.

Practices that allow for the continued use, enjoyment and maintenance of the original quality of the natural world. Practices that do not deplete the earth's resources. Practices that will allow for future generations to enjoy the world in a healthy and natural state. Sustainability is THINKING ABOUT THE FUTURE!!!!

## How would you define sustainability? (continued)

Practices that are not harmful to the environment - ie, walking tours vs. Jeep tours; Water refill stations vs. plastic bottles; clean fuel coaches vs. diesel. After typing this I realize I have ZERO idea what sustainability is.

Practices that meet our current needs without compromising future needs

Practices to help sustain the environment over the long term.

Practices where our operations make every attempt to use sustainable products, materials, bio - compostable, post consumer product, sustainable food items, Monterey Bay Aquarium green list, chemicals. Renewable energy sources. Bio fuels - vehicles, Many others. Practices buy incorporating into our operations items that do not adversely effect or significantly impact the environment and that there sources are sustainable. Our operational are ISO 14001 and a members to 8 environmental organizations dedicated to protecting our environment.

practices which conserve and preserve local resources while generating income and/or products for local producers/businesses

practices which treat the culture and environment in such a way that those areas remain unchanged.

Preparing earth for the future. Economically friendly.

Preserving and enhancing the availability of natural resources for future generations.

Preserving the long term well being of the environment.

preserving what is there without dramatic alternations by using natural and organic sources where necessary

Proactive in keeping cultural, heritage, historical and eco tourism in the forefront of our community planning, events and information.

Producing or creating a product that doesn't tax natural resources but contributes ecologically

Promoting the local environment while at the same time maintaining its natural balance.

Promoting tourism and community growth while maintaining the integrity of the history and culture of the area.

promoting tourism for the long haul, covering broad spectrums--economy, mid range, resort, tour & travel, government, corporate, events, etc. / If you need a further definition I would be glad to oblige but I'm busy right now.....

Promotion and maintenance of an environmental asset.

Protecting environment, contributing to economy and social, health well being of a community

## How would you define sustainability? (continued)

Protecting the environment through recycling, low carbon emissions, cleaner energy usage and saving energy.

Protecting while accessing areas of interest.

Protection of environmental, economic and social entities with the goal of providing resources for our future.

Protection of resources for future use

Providing services to the tourism industry that promotes accessibility to make a sustainable choice. Therefore encouraging travelers to be involved in sustainable choices in their home towns.

Recycling as much as possible. Not wasting fuel or water. Buying locally grown or manufactured products. Volunteering for ecological/social/environmental causes. Not changing linens or towels each day. Using fuel efficient motor vehicles. Limiting golf courses in the desert!

Reduce, re-use and recycle. This includes utilizing technology and best practices, thus minimizing energy and natural resource consumption to reduce the hotel's negative impact on the environment. Also buying local for food and from vendors so additional transportation is minimized. Anything that can be done to reduce the "carbon footprint" of the hotel and help conserve electricity, water, landfill use, gasoline, emissions and products. The purest form of sustainability would involve no outside need for electricity by using wind and solar technology; growing your own food and composting to put nutrients back into the soil; reusing existing building materials for repairs and new structures; capturing and reusing rainwater and watering plants with graywater; riding bicycles and walking; drying clothes outside and I guess you could go so far as spinning your own cloth and using natural dyes to make clothes or going to the river and washing clothes on a rock.

Reducing the carbon footprint. Also-we throw nothing away. We give our old linens to Inn Transitions-a hotel that helps the homeless transition to having a job and getting a permanent place to live.

Responsible & Mandatory recycling in the entire state. Responsible practices for reclaiming water and using our water resources responsibly (Hint: less golf courses). Light pollution reduction.

see above

self sufficient

Similar to above (AOT's definition): a three prong approach - social inclusion, environmental, economic vitality.

Similarly to the way that Geo-tourism or Civic Tourism describes the role of preservation of resources, promoting tourism and helping the community, and not exploiting a resource as an extractive industry.

## How would you define sustainability? (continued)

Simply put sustainability to me is not a short term but rather a long term solution to tourism. Not a one time event or short sighted tourism opportunity but rather a long term solution to a continuous stream of tourism to an area.

Simply stated, "sustainability" refers to adopting practices that ensure our present social, environmental and economical habits and practices don't adversely affect the "credibility" of future social, environmental and economical arenas. Don't use more natural resources than we can replace. Pass down traditions & cultures. Practice and teach fiscal responsibility. Understand sense of place and share it.

Small is beautiful. Footprint is minimal or negligible. Every operational aspect that can be fine-tuned to reduce carbon emissions/ waste is taken. Local foods are used. Land is properly cared for. Water conservation & energy is conserved.

something that can be sustained.. a resource that is not depleted

something that can maintain itself

Something that will continue because it produces what it requires to sustain itself.

Something that will last / endure for a long time

Something we need to do to make sure our land, heritage and where we come from can be here for the future.

sources to retain businesses both for economic success, but from small to large corps. To engage new businesses while retaining old.

Staying within reason of our heritage through our community, family and values.

supporting, maintaining, growing

Sustainability addresses meeting the needs of humans while ensuring resources are not depleted.

Sustainability encompasses maintaining the quality of all Arizona attractions, promoting responsible access and providing an environment that encourages tourism-based business success.

Sustainability in our industry explores innovative ways to address the ever increasing costs of energy and water as well as the moral, ethical, social and political arguments for taking action.

Sustainability is being able to live your life in a manner that does not infringe on hurting the environment and your fellow human beings. It is using only what you need to use and looking at alternative environmentally friendly methods. It is also looking at and how we can help our community.

## How would you define sustainability? (continued)

Sustainability is defined as using local natural products in construction of buildings or using technology in that construction to reduce, reuse or conserve materials, natural resources and energy.

Sustainability in agriculture is using native or naturally occurring elements to provide beneficial and continuing practices that have a benefit or low impact to the environment that allows for continued farming practices over long periods of time.

Sustainability is defined through preservation and promotion.

Sustainability is harvesting or using resources so that the resource is not depleted or permanently damaged.

Sustainability is promoting our way of life while preserving our heritage and the land we live in.

Sustainability is the ability or capacity to endure over an extended period. For humans, sustainability is the potential for long-term maintenance , well being, which has environmental, economic, and social dimensions.

Sustainability is the ability to endure. Keeping the good things of a community (ie: its culture) while progressing forward to self-sufficiency and raising the quality of life of the community and its people.

Sustainability is the ability to use or enjoy an area without depleting, damaging or ruining it.

Sustainability is the conservation and wise use of cultural, heritage or environmental resources in order to ensure their quality and availability for future generations.

Sustainability is the potential for long-term maintenance of well being, which has environmental, economic, and social dimensions.

Sustainability is the potential for long-term maintenance of well being, which has environmental, economic, and social dimensions.

Sustainability is the preservation of the geographical character of the natural environment, culture, aesthetics, and heritage of a place. Sustainability is working in harmony with the natural features of an area and a culture while drawing on the strengths that have allowed that area to flourish in it's natural state. Sustainability in Arizona is an appreciation for what the Sonoran desert has to offer without over exploiting it's resources to the extent that living in harmony with the land is impractical or impossible. Sustainability is balance and harmony within one's environment.

Sustainability is when a resource can last indefinitely.

Sustainability is working together as a society for the improvement of society as a whole; through processes that recycle not only tangible goods but the intangible as well.

## How would you define sustainability? (continued)

Sustainability means consciously reducing our impact in any way possible, such as using more internet advertising than print, and a plethora of other steps we can take. Sustainability also means that we are able to survive economically.

sustainability, building over long period of time, making things last

Sustainable business practices integrate ecological concerns with social and economic ones

Sustainable practices are incorporating actions into your business that long range minimize negative impact on the environment.

Sustainable tourism is tourism attempting to make a low impact on the environment and local culture, while helping to generate future employment for local people

Sustainability is living, working and enjoying the earth in such a way that future generations will be able to do the same. This means that we operate cautiously and respectfully by keeping nature pristine and by protecting it against (over) development. If we develop areas, to do so in the least invasive way, no more than needed and in ways that blend in. Unfortunately we are forced to establish regulations to limit the use of pristine land. / Sustainability means educating people, especially the young ones. It means awareness of what we are doing, how we live, build, drive. It means action in areas that are clearly not sustainable.

Taking all aspects of the environment - geo/natural; historical/cultural; social; etc into proper consideration when making determinations regarding development. Aka - Civic Tourism.

Taking care of the land and environment in a way that human beings, animals and nature can co-exist.

taking measures to ensure that we make informed decisions about business practices in order to sustain the wellbeing of the environment. Respecting the environment for tourists and residents for both today and well into the future

That which endures while improving for the future

That which is good for all through culture, heritage and environmental for the long haul

The ability of a region or resource to be renewed without a negative drain on either other resources or finances.

The ability of an entity to survive and thrive.

The ability of an organization to help the community continue to exist and prosper into the future without having to depend on one particular business or economic stimulus.

The ability to continue and grow an enterprise or entity without negatively impacting the resources needed.

The ability to continue doing what we are doing for the long term.

## How would you define sustainability? (continued)

The ability to define the role of Tourism, create baseline criteria for messaging and then be consistent in the messaging...not panic!

the ability to endure. how systems continue to be diverse and evolve.

The ability to have a resource utilized while mitigating and adapting to the use and keeping it as close to original as possible.

The ability to keep the "numbers" up by attracting guests to what your community offers in the way of local history and landscape.

The ability to maintain

The ability to maintain and evolve a business practice.

The ability to maintain tourism over a long period of time.

The ability to meet present needs without compromising the ability of future generations to meet theirs.

The ability to meet present needs without compromising the the ability of future generations to meet their needs.

The ability to provide for and meet the needs of tourists to our area.

The ability to sustain current economic levels relating to existing conditions. This is a definition in general terms for just the word sustainability since that is all you included in the question.

The ability to use a resource without depleting it.

The ability to use and maintain for the long term, defined social, cultural, and environmental benchmarks with no degradation in the resource or activity itself.

The ability to use resources in ways that allow continuing operations while not depleting resources.

The ability to use/promote/interpret available resources to promote a given tourist area, but in a way that is not a detriment to the resources .

The act of maintaining the environment?

The AOT definition works for me.

The balance between environmental respect, economic vitality and social equity

The capability to maintain productivity continually despite internal and external challenges and influences.

## How would you define sustainability? (continued)

The capacity to endure

The capacity to endure ...

The Green Valley Sahuarita Chamber Of Commerce & Visitor Center has implemented a Tourism Commerce Committee. It represents the communities from Sahuarita to Nogales (the I-19 corridor) Sahuarita, Green Valley, Tubac, Tumacacori, Rio Rico, & Nogales. We meet monthly and share information to support each communities events /programs etc. We also communicate by web links to each communities updated info and calendar allowing each community to better plan Events. We encourage each community to promote and retain their identity history and culture. What better way to show Arizona to Visitors and local residents.

The philosophy and practice of conserving, protecting, maintaining, augmenting, and rebuilding natural resources in order for the environment (and humans in it) to sustain itself in perpetuity.

The practice of being able to maintain a basis for profitable business.

the practice of being environmentally friendly, creating less waste, and utilizing methods to better preserve the environment and natural resources.

The process of enduring, maintaining and preserving.

The same as AOT.

The same way you do.

To be able to maintain a certain level

To be conscientious of reducing energy consumption.

To continue on. Keep doing.

to help businesses survive while protecting the environment and culture of an area

To help the course of a company, in a way to restore forms of capital to take hold of the values to bring forward the current future market.

To increase the efficiency of an operation and as a by-product reduce the impact of the facility on the surrounding community.

To keep local resources and historical (cultural) aspects of an area from being depleted while making them accessible to the public.

To keep the heart of something while being open to changes as the culture changes. To keep up with the current practices and needs of an area or location, enhancing visitors experiences, and engaging in economic development all through ongoing programs and exhibits supported by continued funding.

## How would you define sustainability? (continued)

To keep up, support.

To maintain a business practice in which family values and growth occurs within ones environment or trade.

to maintain a certain level

To maintain something over time at the same quality or quantity we need to succeed.

To maintain what we have while offering new and innovative opportunities to the community.

To make sure that it stays for future generations

TO promote, maintain and carry on the history of our establishment, city and area. Focus on cost reduction and improve our efficiency. Improve environmental issues.

To supply with the necessities of life and keep moving forward.

to support

To support, to keep going, the long-term view of how our actions effect future generations

To sustain a process or procedure that keeps up the pace with the current procedure/process. To keep it going!

to uphold and maintain

To use sustainable resources in order to reduce waste. A process in which resources are renewed through practices adopted.

Tourism is the oldest (since the late 1800's) and largest industry (over \$1 billion) in Coconino County. Effective Management and use of our natural (eg National Forests, Grand Canyon) and man-made (eg Riordan Mansion, Native sites, Snowbowl) tourism resources are critical to its sustainability. Our resources are sustainable in perpetuity, however mis-use of our National Forests (eg Schultz Fire 2010) has had major negative impacts on this natural resource.

Understanding current and future market trends as it relates to the business traveler and vacationers. Making sure that all businesses involved in tourism from Hospitality and Transportation are aware of the current market trends and what the current expectations of the business traveler and vacationer are.

Understanding the effects we have on the environment and working to limit our impact. Implementing environmentally sensitive policies and procedures in the workplace.

Upholding historical practices and cultural habits

use but not overuse to keep the environment pristine

## How would you define sustainability? (continued)

Use of materials and resources that are easily and cleanly replaceable and do not do long-term damage to the environment.

Use without destruction.

Using and creating items that reduces carbon foot printing

Using excellent information / science-technology data / to support the best and most reasonable practices for the better of the environment

Using or enjoying an aspect or benefit of something without depleting it or adversely altering it.

using practices, procedures and products that can be recycled or reused afterward with little to no impact on the environment.

Using the advantages we have to their fullest, while recognizing the need to take care of our environment. For instance, a B&B in a beautiful setting can take advantage of solar energy, recycling, etc. to leave the least imprint on the environment.

Using the cultural and historic elements of my building and area as the basis of my business. A successful business enables me to widen my knowledge and better educate my guests. Tourism depends on areas and structures of historical or cultural interest to be self sustaining.

Utilizing the least amount of resources in the most efficient way to create the optimal life and health cycles for all living things.

We are the Pimeria Alta Historical Society in Nogales. Historical tourism is rarely if ever mentioned. The AOT definition of "sustainable tourism" is nothing more than politically correct jibberish written by a committee of non-writers. "Sustainable," as an absurd term. Does it mean how much tourism the state can sustain? Our tourism is down, so that can't be it. Most historical societies including the Arizona Historical Society use the words, "protect, preserve and promote," when it comes to all the other terms used in the above statement. I would prefer to see "kidnapping many cash endowed non-Arizonans to visit our state," than the above jargon. Finally, I would urge the author to be sent back take English 101.

We are using up natural resources more and more everyday. By living more sustainability, in everything we do, the Earth will be able to continue supporting human life, so that future generations can live as we do.

What is practices that make an impact on our tourism

Working towards or green initiatives to improve ones or company's carbon footprint to making and keeping this world safe and user friendly for the next generation.

working with and for the community and environment with a positive impact on the economy and a low impact on natural resources.

## What, in your opinion, are the next best steps for sustainable tourism in Arizona?

Our state has a history like no other. And is preserved at constant levels to go back in time as well as see the most modern achievements the United States has to offer. From the Grand Canyon to the Biosphere. Southwestern Arizona is currently putting in place the largest solar panel project on earth. This one project will create enough electricity to support 150,000 households. And this is just the beginning of what is to come.

for the State of Arizona to work with small businesses, lower the tax rate for them, help them with small business loans, grants, etc. instead of giving our grants to other countries help us here.

With the present economy and gas prices tough to say. Possibly add additional commercial airline flights. Maybe a flight from Las Vegas

Creating more attractions to stay cool in the summer. I find it very odd that Arizona does not have a great water park

\* Stop acting so badly with respect to racism and racist attitudes; I've had a lot of people tell me that they are avoiding AZ as a destination because they are embarrassed/ashamed of AZ policies with regards to human rights \* protect and preserve the exceptionally fine environmental and cultural resources we have in this state; \* spend money to protect and preserve same \* identify what needs to be preserved and include tribal people, other cultures in the identification and preservation process (don't let it become something dominated by monied interests downstate) \* fend off interests that seek to only make a profit, with no thought to the future of anyone but themselves \* find ways to encourage use of local resources that are environmentally sound and promote things like local, organic agriculture; restaurants using locally grown foods produced by small-scale farms in environmentally friendly ways; \* reduce water use - we are simply going to run out if the Phoenix area and all the communities surrounding it don't stop sucking the rest of the state/region dry \* reach out to people who are interested in sustainability; make it the goal of the tourism "industry" and reward people for moving in that direction

1. Form an alliance with the Southern Arizona Green Chamber of Commerce. / 2. Market establishments and attractions who use green practices.

1. More exploration of the desert on foot or horseback instead of dirt bike or 4-wheeler - which tears up the landscape and creates dust (the major factor in our local air pollution). / 2. More shade - less cement/pavement, which holds the heat. (All parking lots should be required to be covered (with solar panels) / 3. Support our native communities in their effort to maintain their distinct sense of place. / 4. Educate tourists/residents about water conservation and how to enjoy the desert without expecting everything to be green.

1. Recycling programs should be readily available, promoted, and used at all area hotels. / 2. Water usage - specifically for golf courses - should be monitored/restricted. / 3. Public transportation options (vs. car rental) should be widely promoted to visitors.

1. Effective Management of our forests, better control of camping (fees) and limitations on fires. / 2. Require the City of Flagstaff to re-distribute its BBB tax as only 30% is used to promote tourism. Only \$1.5 million of the \$5.5 million raised from this tax is used to fund the City's CVB, this is shameful, the

## What, in your opinion, are the next best steps for sustainable tourism in Arizona? (continued)

rest goes into the general fund. / 3. Better training of our tribal management for their attractions (Antelope Canyon, Monument Valley) could result in a more professional approach to their marketing and facilities management. / 4. Re-direction of Grand Canyon National Park, eliminating flights over the Canyon, more bikes at the park and better ground transportation. / 5. Clean-up of Oak Creek Canyon; stopping traffic through the Canyon, running shuttles like Sabino Canyon in Tucson.

1. identify strengths of tourism related institutions or organizations / 2. examine the needs of these groups and develop a plan to address those areas / 3. aid in promoting the vision of these entities through economic support or collaborative efforts / 4. seek methods that promote cooperative efforts that connect and compliment institutions and programs / 5. determine areas of competition or repetition in order to refine the tourism options

1. promoting, 2. selling, 3. distributing the product (i.e tourism) 4. educating the customer.

1. Providing downtown locations for our guests to enjoy that reflect the heritage and unique benefits of Tucson. / 2. Improved direct flights into Tucson / 3. Larger downtown convention center / 4. Getting back Spring Training or other sporting teams/events / 5. Building a new hotel in downtown with a nationally recognized hotel company

A far stronger water policy, encouraging xeric habits particularly in the desert areas.

A new legislature.

A specific marketing plan and a unified approach / voice in what we have to offer and do in Arizona. Then a process to allow regions and communities to tie to that effort and talk about what they each have to offer once in Arizona.

A step-by-step process for sustainable tourism planning that integrates tourism, heritage and environment goals into one process. It is a useful tool for tourism operators, tourism organizations, local government, land and heritage managers, regional development bodies, communities and others

A. Asset inventory / B. Stakeholder buy-in / C. Financial Responsibility- no "pie in the sky", acknowledgement that Tourism is one of the new "5 Cs" / D. Public/Private combinations / E. National Recognition of Arizona's Natural and man-made attractions

Action Sports and adventure destinations. We already have leisure and golf, etc covered.

Active task group making sure that: / 1) our natural resources are protected: rivers and land especially / 2) incentives are created for eco-building and conversion to green utilities, bringing them into reasonable range for the average income facility / 3) there is creation of fun travel options that support sustainability: active tours, informational tours, presentation tours (self-guided and escorted)

Advertising, balance of seasonal and year round clients.

## **What, in your opinion, are the next best steps for sustainable tourism in Arizona? (continued)**

Advertise and market the #1 thing Arizona is known for "The Grand Canyon". Promote heavily to the closest area's & states. Because of the economy, gas prices etc. we need to market to places that are within 8 hrs or less. (San Diego, Las Vegas etc. ) We need to drive it home and build an awareness factor.

Advertise in those states where the most snowbirds come from and Canada is a big factor now too

Advertising our focus on sustainability, with at least some specific actions we are taking, and highlighting the culture, heritage, and environment that we are conserving.

Advertizing, and classes to teach good practices.

Affordable, Appealing, Area and Attractions to keep people coming and making this their destination

All facets of the community working together to promote managed growth.

All hotels should recycle - paper, cans, and also soap/shampoo, through organizations like Clean the World. Other tourism partners should also recycle. Sustainability sometimes costs a little bit, so people need to be willing to spend something, not just do whatever practices are no extra cost or save money. For instance, biodegradable paper cups are 2 x 3 times more expensive than styrofoam but styrofoam is much worse for the environment, and cups are a very small expenditure. Getting produce and products from local farms and companies is also a great way to improve the sustainability of tourism here.

All the resorts and tourism-oriented lodging establishments in Arizona must be more conscious of their clientele's health, as well as the health of the environment. Our visitors are often more environmentally conscious than are our famous resorts. Recycling all that can be recycled is a must. Green procurement practices must be established, for our supplies as well as retail products. Rooms and businesses should be cleaned using only with natural cleaning products. Water Conservation should become a Number One Priority at our resorts as well as our schools, and governmental facilities. Infrastructure to enable the use of reclaimed water should be mandatory for any new construction (or renovations), whether it be residential, commercial, municipal or for leisure. We have to demonstrate that we are actively working to protect the environment. Our visitors expect it. Whatever environmentally-oriented programs we adopt, as hosts to visitors, will reap a return in goodwill and result in more return customers.

Always acting in an ethical way that takes into account the environment, clients and future generations.

An emphasis on such ideals throughout the state. For instance: Water related tourism in a desert state is not my idea of sustainable tourism.

As with any type of state, county, city town which it tries to gain tourists, it is all about what that town (and its closest proximity) has to offer. WHY would I want to go to Phoenix?? For Sun ONLY during Nov/Dec/Jan/Feb/Mar GREAT weather. WHY would I want to go to Flagstaff? GRAND Canyon, Sedona, and 4 other national monuments. ETC Etc... Now, I live in Flagstaff. I have NO idea of what there is to see and do in Phoenix. The state tourism agency does not do a good enough job in promoting things to see and do in its own state! Keeping tourism dollars IN state is just as important as getting it from OUT of state!

## **What, in your opinion, are the next best steps for sustainable tourism in Arizona? (continued)**

At this point in time when the cost of everything is going up, short of lowering prices I do not know.

Attractions and ability to market them. Unique venues not found everywhere else. Facilities and amenities above standard.

Be more friendly and welcoming.

Becoming a destination location ~ Practical, worthwhile decisions and valuable insight from locals in all areas of the state; while promoting each areas highlights and uniqueness.

Being awarded funds from companies that support GREEN INITIATIVES (NOT THE GOV'T) I believe that companies such as WASTE MGNT- would benefit by offering incentives to hotels or companies- based on what \$ is being saved- give it back in the form of an "energy credit" or discount on garbage removal etc..would be the beginning of a business relationship that would benefit BOTH companies. Thus in turn- more hotels and more companies may 'BUY IN" if there is something to GAIN.

Better ATV, Boat, and recreational options. Benefits for companies who use earth friendly equipment.

Better education and the costs associated with sustainability.

Better promotion of entire state, not just the large metro areas. Our image has been tarnished and it is up to all of us to help change that perception. A better and, easier to navigate, web site for tourists. AOT is great for package deals but it takes at least 3-4 clicks to get to it. Although all town/cities are listed, there seems to be a disconnect once you leave the Phoenix area to anywhere in Arizona. While we all share blame, we need to let our legislators know the real value of tourism and the real and clean revenue it brings to our state. If it is possible, try and bring back grants for the rural towns, i.e. I.C.E. ARRM.

Better public transportation, to decrease fuel consumption. More tax credits for small businesses to make the improvements needed for better sustainability. Send out a newsletter or information on different things businesses can do to improve their sustainability practices.

Branding

By promoting what we already have and what has been given to us from those before us. Remembering the past and keeping it alive and well kept. Weather it be our lands, forests, or museums.

Capturing the next big growth of tourism from Canada, they have money to spend and love to get away from the cold and golf.

Changing the negative political image of the state

Collaboration / Secure the Border / Marketing/PR

Collaboration and organization across the board. We can't continue to be divided between north and south. With regard to sustainable tourism many of the issues are common to us all.

## **What, in your opinion, are the next best steps for sustainable tourism in Arizona? (continued)**

Communicating a good solid message on the wonders of AZ being a point of destination for all people. The message includes the natural wonders, vibrant cities, culture opportunities, diversity, customer service and welcoming attitudes

concentrate on tourism close to where we are. Also overseas as they seem to be still spending money to come here.

Conservation is always best as it has very limited impact on resources. Next is any current renewable technology.

Conserving water

continue educating

Continue encouraging business to pursue reductions in their environmental impacts, and encourage certification programs to provide oversight.

continue to market Arizona vigorously to get more tourists to come here to spend more money and help sustain the state's ability to have a thriving economy.

Continue to market via on-line options and provide certification to those business that practice sustainable work.

Continue to support those properties, industries and and efforts to preserve the state's historical and cultural origins.

Continue workshops to train Chambers and visitor centers how best to market their communities, particularly using new technology. Somehow change the focus and get the word out nationally that our State has a protected border - it seems that many people consider the whole State a dangerous place. Can you control the gas prices? Convince our retailers that if we had cheap gas they would come!

Continued and more focused use of Solar and wind energy. Recycling programs need to be made more widely available to rural areas.

Continued maintenance of our protected park and red rock areas. Public transportation making it easier for tourists to visit the various sites at a minimal cost to the tourist. We already have a number of entities that take tourists out to the red rocks at higher prices. We need something that would enable the tourists to get around better at a lower cost.

continuing marketing.

Controlled usage of areas or resources.

Cooperation and focus from every merchant.

cooperation within the industry to be aware of our resources

## **What, in your opinion, are the next best steps for sustainable tourism in Arizona? (continued)**

Create a united force in the industry. Offer extensive training and certification. Ensure that resorts and hotels consider: How needed equipment be designed to use less resources? Explore the ups and downs of using more sustainable food and beverage sources? How can we businesses reduce

environment impacts and increase profitability? Determine the possibility of integrate sustainability management systems and stay ahead of competitors.

Create awareness within the tourism community and encouraging hotels and attractions to put environment friendly programs into place.

Creating daily flights in and out of Flagstaff from locations worldwide

Develop the interest to change current practices in regards to the subject. Then after the interest is developed tourism professionals have to be willing to change - and that is 9 times out of ten determined by the bottom line. It all starts with if it's cost effective (immediate ROI involved), easy to implement or in what I believe to be rare; a true passion for sustainable practices.

Development of plan - development, marketing, etc.

dido

Difficult question since we are flooded with American, Japanese and European tour buses who have an impact on everything.

Diversification of attractions and promotion of indoor facilities and space to create a year round business environment.

Diversity, weather, become a friendly state for all races.

Don't close any more State Parks and road side rest areas. Open the ones that did close.

don't know

Don't know. Funding would be nice, but seems unlikely. Education of the industry and public would be good, but requires funding!

Economy in general, gas prices, best rates

Ecotourism – Green tourism are the way of the future!

Eco-tourism and cultural tourism.

educate our visitors in sustainable practices while they are tourists and what they can do at home. Set a good example by practicing sustainability - recycling, reduced energy use, water conservation etc.

Educate, educate, and educate business owners and employees.

## **What, in your opinion, are the next best steps for sustainable tourism in Arizona? (continued)**

Educating both the opinion leaders in communities and the owners and operators of tourist-related enterprises of the issues involved in sustainability and its importance.

Education

Education / Reducing the carbon footprint / Encourage more mass transit

Education for and buy-in from all stakeholders.

Education for businesses and visitors on how to tread lightly.

Education for visitors, suppliers and residents including experiences that include teaching everyone about the culture, language, history, etc. This not only teaches the visitors but maintains the information for the new generations.

Education of staff and guests

Education of the public in regards to the vast diversity of our state. More in state advertising to keep Arizonians vacationing in Arizona. Grants and available funding for tourist based economic areas that have been devastated by the current economic downturn.

Education of the work force towards sustainable environmental practices.

Education of tourism on what sustainability is and how they can help. / Create programs/educational materials that assist companies in developing sustainable practices. / Must have "buy in" from upper management and ownership. / Look to Xanterra as a model.

Education to promote a general "buy in"

EDUCATION, and making awareness

Education. For example...in the wine industry, we take a plant that produces year after year & harvest it, ferment it, make wine from it & sell it.

Efficiency is the key practice for the future. The tourism industry needs to focus on utilizing new technologies that help to reduce each organizations carbon footprint. For example, vehicles that get 30 mpg today should be phased out for vehicles that get 60 mpg in the future. Biofuels and renewables are all part of the future. Organizations should encourage car pooling, bicycling or public transportation to get to and from work.

Elevating historical and environmental tourism to be premium attractions along with encouraging sustainable resource practices from tourism operators (tour operators, hotels, B&B's, restaurants, Inns, etc.)

employment and customer service

## **What, in your opinion, are the next best steps for sustainable tourism in Arizona? (continued)**

Encourage affordable alternative energy resources that don't require large corporations to spend immense capital to install.

Encourage certification programs that improve profitability and reduce impact on the environment.

Encouraging cities to take inventory of what makes their cities unique and determine if those elements are in danger of disappearing.

Ensuring that the well being of our cultural, historical, and natural heritage is not lost, ignored or over impacted to the point that it is irreparably compromised.

Environmentally sustainable transportation.

Establish economic incentives for companies engaged in sustainable practices.

Fashion needs to be incorporated into the growth plans, as it is the only industry that connects everyone—from all walks of life. It is the only industry that continues to sustain any community it is made a part of ie. Las Vegas, New York, Los Angeles.

Financial incentives for business to develop and maintain growth of said business

Finding out product available and conducting quantifiable research on the product to see/prove that it is dampening the effect on erosion, etc.

Focus on the "story" of each region, creating a total tourism experience unique to that area and that differentiate each area, thereby broadening the widely diverse array of tourism experiences that Arizona offers.

For the price of gas to go down and to get rid of the Republican legislature that makes stupid laws !

Full implementation of Solar Energy across major tourism areas, Composting practices and a robust recycling program that includes bottle deposit funds.

Funding. Supporting all aspects of tourism.

Further development of sustainable tourism programs, tours, operators, etc. Then, of course, marketing and outreach needs to occur on a greater level.

Gaining broad industry support for sustainable practices.

Get away from the large commercial tourism operations and support small, local businesses who own, practice or a part of the heritage that big tourism operations seek to exploit.

Get rid of the word" rebranding" It's just an easy way to avoid the hard work of identifying the basics of what we really do offer.

## **What, in your opinion, are the next best steps for sustainable tourism in Arizona? (continued)**

get the message out in other states/countries that AZ has so much to offer - from dry desert to amazing skiing, woods, rocks and beautiful roads to cruise on.

Getting competent people in political office. People who care about business in the entire state, not just Maricopa county. We need to stop shooting ourselves in the foot with controversial legislation that

stops people from wanting to visit and spend money in Arizona. At times, we look like fools to the rest of the country and we've made Mexican tourists feel unwanted.

Getting the word out about current events that are happening within the state as well as promoting the many venues that are always available, i.e. Grand Canyon, Lake Havasu, Monument Valley, etc. In addition there are many local attractions that could be better promoted to potential visitors.

government incentives

Hard to say.

Have the state recognize that having state parks is essential to small tourist destinations

Haven't really thought about it.... social media, internet and face to face....

Having tours that deal with teaching to others, especially towards our young children, rather than having tour operators deal with false advertisement and selling out to those who only want a tour.

I am a member of S.E.D.I.-the Sustainable Economic Develop Initiative. This is part of GBN. We are putting on seminars to educate hotel owners on how they can "Green the Bottom Line" / There is a lot of misinformation out there. So the next step would be education.

I am not aware of where we are now in the process. If this survey is the first step with the goal of finding a starting place, it is a good start. Once we have more information we can devise a plan to identify areas that are currently sustainable, areas that can be made sustainable with little effort/dollars and areas that require extensive intervention either financially or politically, and put plans in place to address these issues.

I believe that Arizona will need to advertise any areas in which it is working on sustainability in order to be competitive.

I believe that encouraging the use of re-usable water bottles is a huge step for Arizona tourism. Lets get rid of all those plastic disposable water bottles sold all over and given out at hotels or on tours. If we sell only re-usable bottles and increase the amount of fill stations, we would save alot of plastic. Also, I believe that each tour operator should make a point to educate their guests on the importance of conservation, especially with water in Arizona. The hotels should absolutely all have the little card that says, if you don't need a new towel set, please just hang it back up and we won't re-wash it to save on energy and water. Also, hotels should not replace the soap in a room if the people are staying another night. We waste so much soap using it to wash hands a few times and then it gets thrown away by the cleaning crew. I believe we could really help by including more local and organic food options at restaurants, hotels, and on tours. It could be a selling point as well as helping out the environment.

## **What, in your opinion, are the next best steps for sustainable tourism in Arizona? (continued)**

I do not know.

I feel that the next steps towards sustainable tourism would be to work with local organizations and possibly make a set of regulations that will help promote safe and responsible tourism all around the state.

I have no idea or suggestions at this time.

I have no idea.

I have no opinion

I have no opinion. I will comment that it would be wonderful to curb the bad national press about the border violence. I live southwest of Tucson near the ASDM, and guests from all over the World ask about "safety" because of the border violence news they've read about or seen on TV. It has made me wonder how many travelers chose NOT to visit Arizona because of the bad press???

I honestly don't know...

I really don't have an opinion.

I think it is a bit of a fad. Of course we need to take care to protect the environment and have as little of an impact as possible, but some of the "green" stuff I see appears marginal at best. I was on a dolphin watching tour in Maui and they used corn based cups to protect the environment. Well, the boat was belching out more smoke than a poorly tuned bulldozer and they ran many trips every day. We like to be "sensibly green" and realistic.

I think promoting Ecotourism will help all aspects of the tourism business have a more "green" bend.

I would like to see organizations continue to educate, but I personally, am not going to go or not go to an attraction because it claims to be sustainable.

I would start with something. I have no idea what others are doing.

Improve the business climate for tourism and tourism-based businesses.

In my opinion...the widening of Hwy 87 from Payson to Winslow, to allow better access to northeast Arizona and the magnificent culture and history of the Navajo and Hopi Nations. Northeast Arizona tourism has been untapped and underplayed by State entities for too long now. Just sayin...

In my opinion the state needs to quit scaring the hell out of people with our laws being passed on immigration, gun control, and cutting education. This would be followed by once again letting everyone in the rest of the states know we're open, friendly and have a lot to offer.

Incentives or policies put in place to create more cooperation toward a sustainable environment.

## **What, in your opinion, are the next best steps for sustainable tourism in Arizona? (continued)**

Increased positive promotion of our State and its' assets. Promotion of arts and culture - they endure and last throughout the passing of the seasons.

Item 1: Determine the most heavily requested/utilized resources in AZ / Item 2: (Re)establish acceptable impact limits and methods for mitigating those impacts / Item 3: Establish how you are going to institute and maintain these methods

Keep advertising to let people know about our diverse state and all it has to offer.

Keep off road vehicle out of National Forests.

Keep promoting what Arizona, and her regions have to offer the guest that they won't find elsewhere.

Keep the beauty of the State. Here, in the Coronado Forest, we are plagued by cartels bring dope through our region. Help us make this a safe place for tourists. We are gifted by beauty in the woods and canyons. Help us keep it.

Keeping all aspects of interest open for individuals to enjoy. People are attracted to Arizona because of weather all year around.

Less regulation.

Limiting sprawl, encouraging infill in cities, protecting and providing wilderness areas and areas for public use for hiking, horseback riding, birding.

Listening to the guest's needs. Offering items that meets their needs at a price they can afford. Providing an enjoyable vacation or getaway in a package that makes it stress free for them. Making a memorable event.

Look into ways that simplify viewing nature while not disturbing it.

Looking at projects that will attract tourism.

Low water usage. High oxygen producing greenery.

Maintain and reinforce a message of the geological beauty of the southwest and honor the heritage of the region through promoting activities and events which deliver the flavor and spirit of the Arizona experience. The message of come play golf in Arizona attaches the tourism success and failure to an industry which is experiencing negative growth in participation and economic impact.

Maintaining our land, Parks tourist sites to welcome tourism to our state. Which will help increase the economy.

Maintaining the attractions that draw tourism here & allow for more of the same. Need evening entertainment/shows/activities.

## **What, in your opinion, are the next best steps for sustainable tourism in Arizona? (continued)**

Make Arizona a place that people want to visit on vacation. We have a state that offers the Grand Canyon and the Sonoran Desert in Tucson. Arizona is a great state. To promote the Arizona you need to have professional people take the lead, not the politicians. the state needs to invest in tourism just like

they invested in the business community with tax incentives. the state needs to spend money to make money.

Make the treasures that we have known to those who do not live in our state.

Making new opportunities available and a viable option to companies. It can not be so difficult that they are not willing to do it.

Making sure that all demographics within our population understand the importance of sustainability in our state so that they share an appreciation for it and seek to live by it--especially in terms of our growth as a state and the way in which we show it off to others.

Making sure we keep the beauty and parks open for people to want to come here and see it. It is not all about the biggest and best, sometime simple and understated is needed.

Manage tourism landscaping to highlight the natural area and limit water use in decorative or unnecessary landscaping.

Mandatory recycling especially for restaurants/hotels, etc.

Many. Hotels must use water saving devices, replace high energy use items, start using top solar daylighting instead of light bulbs during the day in all flat-roofed buildings, generate solar photo voltaic electricity (although it is too expensive for most....take out all HID lighting (like you see in the convention centers and ballrooms of hotels... shame!) incorporate LED lighting as much as possible, reduce water use toilets, signage not to replace sheets daily, buy new electric vehicles/Segways for onsite shuttles, windmills at hotels in NE AZ, landscape with LED lighting, recycle biodegradable waste, minimize trash, gray water for landscaping, high seer air conditioning..then have every property post their onsite environmental policy, promote hiking, exercise, walking,promote protection of native plants, refuse vendors who damage the environment and have a vendor use policy, buy recycled carpet, recycled plastic benches, recycled paper, hotels become paperless and use email, offer environmental discount for rooms with motion sensors for lighting, heat and cooling.

Marketing all that AZ has to offer

Marketing Arizona as a prime destination for national and international travelers.

Marketing Greenlee County, increase overnight accommodations, establish annual events

Marketing the diversity of Arizona and having money from the State to generate interest not only nationally but internationally.

Marketing travel to Arizona and showing people what an amazing place AZ is once they arrive. More travel = More jobs. Also, providing tourism leaders or workers with ideas/suggestions on how to do so.

## What, in your opinion, are the next best steps for sustainable tourism in Arizona? (continued)

Mass marketing. Bringing in visitors from other state and countries to see AZ's cultural and natural wonders. Getting tourists to visit some of the lesser known sites and attractions. A huge step would be to start reversing the negative image so many people have of this state. Our image as viewed by so many has detrimentally impacted visitation.

Monitored use of popular areas, with controls in place to minimize negative human impact. Keep "creature comfort" improvements to a minimum in wilderness areas. Provide proper disposal methods (i.e. chemical or compost toilets) in popular wilderness areas.

MORE ATTRACTIONS AND HIKING TRAILS FOR ACTIVE ADULTS AND YOUNG FAMILY AND COLLEGE AGE THINGS TO DO.

more collaboration with in the state there is enough for everyone. Reach out to the foreign travelers. Market to the diversity of our local and seasons

More green initiatives in the industry.

More marketing

More positive public relations and less Border coverage and emphasis on the "dangers in the desert">

More promotions in the White Mountain area of Arizona

Most of AZ is rural... why not start there. AZ no longer supports MS communities, but does do a good job at talking it up. Gee whiz, look @ phoenix and how many dollars get put there. Look at weather for our state... it spends less than 10% of its time to address areas outside of phoenix, just as the AZ government does.

My yoga center is small and doesn't affect that much. But I imagine big hotels could make a difference if they used green practices, especially in their cooling systems. I would also tax places that are obviously unsustainable very highly, such as hummer tours. It would be nice to have a reward system or an extra marketing benefits if we follow sustainable standards, such as converting our lightbulbs to energy efficient or keeping the air conditioner at a certain level.

n/a

No idea

Not exactly sure what "sustainable tourism" is? Is it making people's trips here have less of an impact? ie encouraging rental fleets at Sky harbor to carry more hybrids>

Not sure

not sure

## **What, in your opinion, are the next best steps for sustainable tourism in Arizona? (continued)**

Not sure I know how to answer this, depends on the goal and how sustainability is used in conjunction with tourism. We teach tourists about sustainability in Civano, as most have not heard about it. We also include new urbanism, ecology and recycling.

Not sure what sustainable tourism would be....keeping the parks open?

Not sure.

Now that you have added the word tourism, I would define it as the ability to sustain the current economic / levels existing in tourism. Notice I have not discussed growth in tourism - only sustainability. The best steps are to provide economic opportunities for those of us in the industry to market more effectively, to monitor the quality of what tourists experience while touring Arizona and opportunities to learn more effective marketing strategies including, but not limited, to cross-marketing techniques.

Number one is getting the idea out that tourism is clean and a definitive money maker for our State and our County.

offer the best product possible. by making improvements where possible

One of the best steps is the Centennial project. We have used it here to improve and educate the community and its visitors on our unique cultural and historic features and enhance community attachment.

Out of state advertising, self sustaining business models for maintaining our resources.

Partner with CVB's & EDC's.

Partner with local attractions, restaurants, artists, etc

People are always looking for something that interests them. The points of interest, the history, the landscape that's different from everywhere else and diverse entertainment venues offered in the Phoenix metropolitan area and of course the weather. I think that adding new interests to keep people coming back is key.

Population is getting older address those needs. Provide transportation, plan/design it affordable.

preservation, education our visitors in learning about current landscapes and conditions. using native arizonans to contribute to the land and culture they love. we can learn more from experienced people who know the natural surroundings

Preserving our historic communities.

Preserving our history and heritage.

PROMOTE OUR WESTERN HERATAGE

## **What, in your opinion, are the next best steps for sustainable tourism in Arizona? (continued)**

Promote the unique aspects of the environment, culture and heritage of the state and individual regions through groups like AOT and local CVB's. Where appropriate, work with local organizations and tribes to get support for tourism.

Promote water conservation measures and responsible tourism.

Promoting and advertising Arizona throughout the world.

Promoting Arizona to the rest of the world as a great place to visit. Encourage local city councils and chambers of commerce to individually work on promoting their own area. Maybe offer financial assistance.

Promoting Certified Organic farming operations through value added places of interest such as The McKenzie Inn Bed and Breakfast. We have used the latest in conservation technology in the construction of the Inn designed for our geographic location that promotes conservation and educates on the importance of conservation, reuse and recycle practices.

Promoting eco-tourism within our beautiful national forests, which are tremendously underutilized.

Promoting locally owned and operated tourism businesses.

Promoting sustainable tourist sites and public transportation systems.

Promoting the nature resources and historical locations in all the major cities in Arizona

Promoting the unique aspects of the culture of the Southwest to attract visitors, and to educate the general public about the merits of sustainability, and conscious spending of their tourism dollars.

Promoting the unique opportunities afforded visitors to Arizona.

Promotion and action.

Promotion of the beauty of the land and outdoor activities year round.

promotions and advertizing Arizona as a destination location

Protect natural environments. Educate people on what a healthy environment and sustainability means. Promote eco tourism. Prevent cities from sprawling. Expand possibilities for public transportation, which would limit the needs for widening of roads and parking. Support projects for new energy technologies.

protecting the beautiful desert landscape in its natural state so that future generations can continue to enjoy it.

Providing resources for locally-based tourism and service industries to learn to run their businesses in a sustainable and socially/environmentally responsible manner. Reward and recognize businesses seen as making strides in these areas.

## **What, in your opinion, are the next best steps for sustainable tourism in Arizona? (continued)**

quit using scare tactic about border danger and focus on state budget and those tourism opportunities which need to continue to be developed. There is more to the state than 1070 and the grand canyon--take risks!

Realize that earth resources are mostly finite. Recognize that surface water and ground water are connected. Be kind to your Mother Earth

Recognition and celebration of the natural resources and environment indigenous to our state.

Recognition that tourism is a viable industry that generates revenue, that tourism is economic development.

Recognizing that sustainable tourism is a viable industry in Arizona.

Reduced consumption of energy, reduced production of waste, and increased awareness of environmentally unsound practices.

Reducing sales taxes. In Williams, a small tourist town, sales taxes are over 11.25%. There should also be more advertising directed toward northern Arizona. There should be more shuttles in our town to reduce traffic and ease parking.

Review history and learn about the sustainable areas without boxing communities into theme categories.

seal the borders

see above

Since tourism is a huge part of our economy we need to make sure that it is supported by our government, i.e. cutting it out of the budget. It's ludicrous.

Start with ensuring local attractions are operating sustainably.

State legislation prohibiting the use of products that are considered in the extreme of negative environmental impacts, Foam products for example. Education and demand from purveyors to carry the environmentally friendly and sustainable products. Education of the industry.

State Office of Tourism should adopt it as a key program for which it offers training, learning programs.

Stated above

stop talking about it start doing something maybe incentives to save water

## **What, in your opinion, are the next best steps for sustainable tourism in Arizona? (continued)**

Sustainable development is development that meets the needs of the present without compromising the ability of future generations to meet their own needs. Tourism should be managed via comfortable, energy efficient means of public and private transportation. Education of the public on how to be good land stewards when visiting natural areas is critical. Education can also encompass learning how to "green" their own homes and public spaces both in Arizona and back home.

Sustainable tourism development meets the needs of present tourists and host regions while protecting and enhancing opportunities for the future. It is envisaged as leading to management of all resources in such a way that economic, social and aesthetic needs can be fulfilled while maintaining cultural integrity, essential ecological processes, biological diversity and life support systems. The next best steps can help to - develop audits, scoping projects and preliminary assessments of tourism development potential in regions - identify tourism and heritage issues which need to be considered in management, regional or business planning - develop regional heritage and tourism strategic plans and action plans - assist in developing business plans for new or existing heritage tourism products - foster more effective planning for infrastructure development at heritage places - evaluate options and establish a stronger business case for an idea or proposal. - Tourism operators: to improve existing tourism products or identify opportunities for new products. Following the steps can help to build stronger relationships with land and heritage managers and communities - Local government: to develop plans for strategic development of local or regional tourism, and to help develop particular projects - Tourism businesses: to improve awareness of sustainable tourism issues among staff, in developing business plans and assist in streamlining development and approvals processes - Tourism organizations: to identify new nature or heritage based tourism development opportunities and check that sustainable tourism policies are being advanced throughout their areas of interest - Park managers: to help establish communication links and partnerships with tourism interests - Community groups: to consider the costs and benefits of tourism for their region - Cultural heritage agencies and attraction managers: to ensure that cultural heritage places are effectively managed as a tourism resource and that visitor management programs are sustainable. The framework can assist in developing briefs for projects at visited heritage places - Indigenous community or enterprise: to hold community meetings and discussions to chart a course for steps to follow - Regional development organizations: to check whether sustainable tourism issues have been addressed adequately in regional plans / - Interpretation officers: to explore new options for presenting a place through sound decision-making steps - Everyone: to get together to discuss issues and develop common aims for long-term future benefit

Sustainable tourism is the concept of visiting a place as a tourist and trying to make only a positive impact on the environment, society and economy.

Sustainable tourism should reflect a shared vision of the community and developers/commercial enterprises. There should be accountability. Encourage cooperation between destination communities and incoming commercial ventures. Though I am a fan of having undisturbed areas of wilderness, actual Wilderness Areas should be limited as Wilderness Areas do not promote sustainable tourism and can harm small communities.

Tax break incentives to tourism related businesses who support sustainability. Being that I am with a Tribe, I would recommend better collaboration/support with Tribes who have tourist destinations. AOT falls short in this area, most promotion is of Navajo Nation...which is great however there is ALOT more to AZ than that.

## **What, in your opinion, are the next best steps for sustainable tourism in Arizona? (continued)**

Tax incentives to be able to convert property into being green

Teaching respect for our unique environment, providing exciting opportunities for cultural activities, preserving forest/desert parklands.

That is a difficult question considering we are trying to create jobs or sustain them while balancing the environment. I suppose to keep the tourism as "clean" as possible while building jobs.

The next best steps for sustainable tourism in Arizona is a continued emphasis on highlighting Arizona's natural beauty, ensuring Arizona's City, State and National Parks are maintained, open and available to our visitors to appreciate the natural beauty the desert southwest has to offer. Sustainability also lies in the continued promotion and education sharing the history and culture unique to Arizona.

The state legislature needs to understand that they are not creating a brand for Arizona that makes people want to visit.

The we, the operators of the tourism industry in AZ become educated and truly understand the term means and why it is important to us all...

There are so many negative links to the state that it will take continual, strong and unique approaches to overcome the stigmas and encourage individuals and groups to come experience Arizona. This situation along with the economy will also dictate financial incentives for individuals and groups.

There are three aspects of development that need to be sustained for tourism in Arizona; economic, social and environmental.

There needs to be incentives by tourism based businesses (lodging, food, attractions) for visitors to come but to reduce their impact while here. Is there a cost savings for not washing towels? Pass it on. Is there a way to reduce petroleum consumption? Provide a monetary incentive or "rewards" program. Educating the visitors and developing a reduced impact tourism industry is the next step.

To continue to market the State, then again you need funding to do so.

To ensure that tourists are treated properly by the industry. For example, hotels should not overbook by 20-25%. When tourists have a confirmed reservation, even PRE-PAID reservations, they should have the room available to them when they arrive. Accountability in the total tourist industry is necessary. And for EVERY tourist. And there should be state-wide calendars of events published throughout the state to inform visitors to local happenings, and happenings in other parts of the state. If there are gaps in events then perhaps communities can produce annual events to draw tourists, especially for areas that have "off-seasons" or "shoulder seasons"

To give the tourist the best possible service, and keep prices within their reach. Do more national advertising so that everyone knows of the great tourist attractions that AZ has to offer.

## **What, in your opinion, are the next best steps for sustainable tourism in Arizona? (continued)**

to keep the environment sustainable you either have to limit use or devise new ways of looking or using it. So the way it is used limits the environmental impact.

to not sell out our cultural and natural resources for short-term/immediate financial returns. develop product that asks for engagement and experiential involvement vs. drive-by tourism

To promote our natural resources in order to attract more tourism as well as having a solid industry that could sustain its current tourist market.

TO SUPPLY WITH NECESSITIES, TO KEEP GOING.

To teach those who want to incorporate it in their business how to partner with one another and be beneficial for all parties. Part of the biggest challenge is to have businesses know what it is to have sustainable tourism, formalize the process and then promote it to potential visitors of Arizona.

Tourism in Arizona is based on our incredible natural environment. Take care of it and it will take care of us.

Tourism in Arizona is currently machiavellian (we want out of state tourists and also for locals to stay here). We need stronger partnerships with surrounding areas to market the region, even if that means locals travel.

tourism which enhances local economic prosperity rather than benefitting external economic interests

Tourism will not rebound or become sustainable until our government officials stop making negative laws that affect the perception of our state. Formula funding also needs to be restored as the tourism industry generates revenues, taxes and creates jobs.

Understanding the future needs. I believe Arizona is working so hard on the present that they are totally forgetting about the future which our children and their children will need us to take care of now.

Unsure

Unsure as I don't follow this.

Upgrade existing infrastructure and advertise

Use business models to insure the public owned areas of interest can carry themselves as best possible. Support the private sector in the areas of historic preservation

Use Geotourism concept to promote awareness of sustainability principles and sense of place to help emphasize the distinctiveness of Arizona as a state and how we use the sum of all its parts to appeal to visitors with diverse interests and continue to reinvest to protect our assets with best use practices.

using eco-friendly products and services in a facility as well using solar and wind generation to power them

## **What, in your opinion, are the next best steps for sustainable tourism in Arizona? (continued)**

Using our resources in a conserving way, for instance capturing solar power instead of relying on gas, electric and carbon emissions. Coming together to share ideas on how we can move ahead as a community without depleting our resources for future generations. An assessment of how we are using our resources, why we are using them the way that we do and developing an action plan to change the way we live.

Utilizing solar for future building destinations; migrating valley transit and hospitality transportation to biofuels; continue developing low-emission transportation; reducing plastic drinking bottle consumption

Watch for what the Arizona Historical Society will be doing in the next year, and you will likely see a plan for positive and PRODUCTIVE steps.

Water conservation will be key as without this element all else is gone.

Water usage.

We believe the biggest next step is our Marketing efforts as a State. We have to spread the word of what we are doing as this is becoming more important to each and every traveler.

We have to find a way to stop the things that hurt the tourism industry as a whole. We have to use our size to influence the government to take hold of the oil crisis, the lack of travel when the oil prices spike nearly ruins this industry and when people get used to "staycations" to save money it is hard to get them on the road again. Bringing people to your city and giving them multi cultural activities to participate in while there.

We must do something about out-of-control OHV use!

we must plan our growth in constant consideration of the taxing we will levy on our environmental resources to ensure that our growth does not impair the world we live in.

We must reopen our state parks. Tourism is big business in Arizona and local communities, especially those in rural areas, have their hands tied by steps taken by our state government. Closing areas has led to vandalism, trash, and the decline of our natural wonders. (Check out Salt River Canyon). If the state wants to sustain our tourism the funds must exist to protect and promote the sites.

We need a source to recycle glass...this is a huge opportunity.

WE need to better define/recognize promote and support what is a designated office of Tourism

We need to keep on the cutting edge of what is new and hip as well as making sure that we reach out to people who live in the "cold" climates. When our clients come to Arizona they are coming to enjoy the weather and Golf. Many of our clients have been coming here for years, they have seen and done almost everything we have to offer. We need new and original ideas to help "sell" Arizona.

## **What, in your opinion, are the next best steps for sustainable tourism in Arizona? (continued)**

We need to promote stay vacations in the White Mountains of Az. We have so much to offer and the state as a whole has no idea what this part of the state offers. When guest come to visit their first comment is I cant believe I am in Az. How beautiful and what a change of what the country sees on TV as AZ the Desert State.

We need to support preservation of our assets, parks, public lands, historical landmarks, etc. Az has many assets like route 66 for instance that are falling away and need outside support to maintain them through public private partnerships. This is a big attraction that's rotting away. These buildings and attractions could be repurposed and given new life instead of tearing them down and building anew. Once this type of history is gone, it's gone forever.

Work to get federal agencies (USFS) to allow public tours of the world's largest telescope, the Large Binocular Telescope located at the Mount Graham International Observatory near Safford, AZ. Currently the USFS has held up permits allowing public tours since May 2010. In addition to excluding the public, it is detrimental to students (middle school through college) as it eliminates their access to science on the mountain. An excessive regulatory environment has curtailed opportunities for the public to become educated in the sciences and scientific investigation on Mount Graham.

working on resource reduction, while still providing positive experiences for the guest.

Working together to promote and advertise these practices - industry-wide

Working with small local groups that are interested in keeping the community viable while bringing in income. Using local labor instead of large out of state corporations to bring in business. Funds and assistance in operating a business should be easily available for local people promoting business in a specified radius of where they live.

Would help to have a plan. There appears to be no strong leadership. The tourism is generally a fractured, and even competitive industry. It will take a strong leader or organization to get the varied groups with different interests and goals to work together.

You have to look at what Arizona has to offer and how we can compare to other neighboring states and why people should choose us as their destination travel. If it is the business traveler what can we offer as to the the business conference environment and why they should choose us over lets say Las Vegas. Making sure that we keep our rates competitive so we can attract all type of travelers year keeping the Hospitality and Transportation sector viable year round not just Sept. through April.

## Sustainability initiatives - Others

Arizona

Authenticity

Certified Organic

Community Stakeholders

Community desire for Certified Organic Produce and whole foods.

Constant maintenance of our park to make it more beautiful

Doing the right thing

Eco-tourism

Education of younger school age children

Funding

Go green

Great website exposure & social media

Increased gifting

It's the right thing to do.

It's what we have to do

It has not become a core part of our mission. No one has asked it to be considered important.

It is in alignment with what we practice and our mission.

It's the right thing to do

Looking for ways to diversify our economy and partnering with local government organizations to all work toward the same goals.

Mission driven

National Park Service Interest and pleasing Environmentalists concerned with maintaining wilderness areas

National Park Service mission is to protect, preserve, and conserve

None we don't care about sustainability

Not applicable

Not even thought of.

Our historical character requires huge annual investment in renovations

Our own values

Owner

Personal commitment

Personal interest

Personal Philosophy

Preservation of the land and historic structures

Research

Resources

Responsibility to future generations

Right thing to do

Right thing to do. Owner's family in sustainability.

Show that it makes good business sense.. .

Spiritual interest

## **Sustainability initiatives - Others (continued)**

Support Groups

That's how I was raised

Tourists

Try to keep the customers we have and get new ones

Trying to set a new standard

Unemployment rate, need for businesses

Use Science, technology and research experiments to learn more about the future of our planet

We are a government entity

We are an emerging museum with 100% volunteers. Although this effort is clearly necessary we simply do not have the manpower or the funds to address it now.

We are the organization. Sustainability practices are ingrained.

We want to help the environment

## Organization internally communicates sustainability goals - Other

"Green" teams  
1 person business

Advertisements include a mention, website for our environmental program, brochure, pitching story ideas to media writing about the environment, on company letterhead

All staff meetings  
Board meetings  
Committee

Committees' economic development, tourism, education, membership, government relations, special events, networking and cooperative events with other chambers

Communication, communication, communication  
Community involvement  
Company newsletter with paychecks  
Consistent education  
Contact locally  
Conversation  
Council meetings  
Customer survey  
Day to day interaction with guests  
Dedicated site-wide meetings  
Department and staff meetings  
E newsletters  
Employee meetings  
Equipment purchases  
Example  
Face to face communication  
General attitude  
General conversations  
Goals  
Hilton worldwide light stay program  
Husband to wife

I'm too small to do these, but we talk about it at length among my wife and I and our room cleaner  
In staff management meetings

Informational meetings  
Inherent values  
Involvement of everyone  
Leave no trace  
Meeting with combined input  
Meetings  
Meetings

## Organization internally communicates sustainability goals - Other (continued)

Meetings and conversations

Meetings with different departments on constant sustainability communications

Monthly meetings

My husband and i talk about it.

Newsletter to customer database

No well communicated to employees - policies implemented through general manager

None

One-person company; no need to communicate

Only 4 employees!

Organic certification by third party certifier.

Our board comprises the core of volunteers seeking to promote this museum. We meet monthly to carry out our mission.

Outreach materials, resolutions, council actions, etc.

Owner participation business

Public education and free programs

Recycle

Regular staff meetings

Revising our business plan and mission statement, board meetings with feedback to staff, constant communication with city, county, & community leaders. There are only three of us - it's not too hard to communicate well.

Small staff: conversations

Special events

Staff & employee meetings

Staff meetings

Staff meetings

Staff meetings and newsletter communication to members

Staff meetings. We are a family business of 3.

There are only a few of us, & we talk

This is a "mom and pop" organization; your question doesn't directly apply

Training and informal meetings

Verbally in meetings

Verbal

Verbal communication

Vision & mission statement

Volunteerism & outreach

We are a micro-business that buys local

We are a new and growing chamber of commerce. I find that 80% of our communication is through email contacts.

We are a small historic guest ranch with less than 10 employees

We are self employed

**Organization internally communicates sustainability goals - Other (continued)**

We don't

We live them

We will eventually use all of those strategies, but don't now

Website

Website

## Organization engages external stakeholders-Other

A sustainability report in each guest room

Annual event

Changed buying habits. Representation on local sustainability commission.

Conversion to organics from garden supplies to housekeeping

Education by example while on the trips

Face-to-face with stakeholders

Host sustainable tourism summits.

Look into other options

NA

None of the above

None of the above

Not applicable

Participation in activities

Participates in Training

Seminars and conferences

There are no external stake holders

We try to work well with our community partners. We hold quarterly networking opportunities, we send out press releases and use social media, we advertise locally, statewide and sometimes nationally. Our Board members are involved in other organizations at leadership level but ours has priority.

## Barriers to implementing sustainable practices- Other

2 person B&B

A successful business is by definition, practicing sustainable strategies.

Abuse by guests of our utilities esp. From the Phoenix area

All of the above

By complexity, we probably did too much too quickly. We are still improving how we do things and need to have constant communications/education on our practices.

Challenging to change old habits

City

City Indifference

Does not really apply

Doesn't apply

Don't know

Federal Regulations and Policies

I feel that we are doing all that we can

Indifference of the host community

Just trying to survive

Lack of understanding of residents

Legislature

Location is overlooked

N/a

NA

No barriers

No barriers, we are a small company

No time...too busy trying to make a living

None identified

Not a high priority given conditions

Our business relies on propane gas--there is no alternative available.

Our sustainability relies on winter visitors. Everything we do depends on people traveling to Tucson and visiting our facility

Our vendors don't offer resources'

Since we are owner occupied business, our guests see our practices first hand

Small business

Supply or resources of products

The economy has made many businesses cautious in their spending habits. In a rural area like ours many of our members have both parents working and then they have school and church activities which sometimes leaves little time for business networking opportunities. We continue to look for viable programs that add value to their membership. Also, there are generational methods that have to be adapted to reach our audience.

Time to start this

Too small.

Tribal Government

## **Barriers to implementing sustainable practices- Other (continued)**

Uncertainty of goals

Very old property so costly to engage

We are a very small healing center with a lack of staff.

We simply don't care

## **Waste reduction measures - Other waste reduction measures**

1. Rain and run off water collection for watering gardens

all soap/shampoo/etc. is recycled

bag lady program created, fashionably green boutique

Biodegradable soaps, detergents, refill ink cartridges, recycle batteries, email and/or electronic usage

Bring own bags to grocery stores (when I remember)

buy in bulk & local

Campaign to reduce water plastic bottles in park, divert plastic water bottles used in parks to be made into carpet, divert other recyclables to make products, collect and recycle propane containers from campers and recycle,

clean up days

compost & grey water

Composting

computer recycling and tire disposal

Donations of all unused guest rooms amenities

Education local business on Recyclables through our EDC

Education of our guests

energy star appliances and making facilities more energy efficient equipment

E-waste pick-ups

Gray water system in place

Green Team headed up by the General Manager

Leave no trace

leave no trace in the backcountry

not buying new vans redoing existing vans

purchase of recyclable products

recycle cardboard

recycle office paper

recycle receptacles in each guest room, reuse keys, recycle newspapers, lights, some of the product used to build the hotel comes from recyclable goods

recycle wine bottles, laundry reduction measure

Reuse materials for site improvements

Reuse towel program-Save Water Program

Reverse vending (at North Rim of Grand Canyon), using bioX for the biodegradation of organic materials

Seek donations of fabricated exhibits to be reused and revitalized for our visitors.

Solar projects

Solid waster monitoring. Purchasing policy to reduce packaging waste and others.

use recyclable materials when possible

using natural cleaners and recycled office supplies.

waste oil recycling

water conservation using Bactifeed Microorganism in agriculture production

water protection measures

### **Waste reduction measures - Other waste reduction measures (continued)**

We have converted vehicles to propane, we recycle used oil, we reduce energy whenever possible, we purchase from vendors who utilize local produce

We try to limit plastics and usage of water

We use what we buy.

Xeriscaping Landscape Practices

## Energy efficiency measures - Other energy efficiency measures

Be Hopi  
Bicycling  
Buying newer vehicles  
Dark skies city, wildcat wastewater and landfill innovative measures  
Excess electricity capture  
Fewer hours open  
Guest education eg using our fans instead of ac  
High temp for a/c, low temp for heat  
Installed ceiling fans  
Light timers  
Load controller  
Lock the thermostats  
Lower energy use  
Monitoring and recording of energy use. All property is fluorescent and moving to LED.  
O digital set back a/c thermostats in all guest suites.  
On demand in floor heat  
On demand water heaters  
Potential hydro electric to take phantom ranch off power grid  
Programmable thermostat  
Promoting education of youngsters on the efforts of energy efficiency.  
Purchase of new balloon so that less heat is lost and less fuel is needed to lift it.  
Radiant heated floors.

Recycle paper/conserve heat-we are not in an area that has renewable energy available to small businesses-but they are working on it

Reduction in heating levels  
Seeking grant money for new windows  
Solar passive design  
Strategizing all shopping trips to Costco, Walmart, Safeway, online banking, etc.  
Thermostat controls  
Timers, photo cells  
Turn off in-room water heaters & ac units when no guests present, timed outdoor lighting  
Turning off water heaters and a/c when condo not occupied  
Upgrading old equipment  
Use heaters instead of furnace  
We're promoting alternative energy usage by our members.  
We are looking into alternative lighting

We offer trade, barter & swap, bag lady program, reuse hang tags & everything possible, create fashion accessories out of unusable items.

## **Air quality measures - Other air quality measures**

Dust control

Dust control when doing our outdoor adventures

No fragrant detergents, no bleach, no perfumes for guests

No idle policies

Non-smoking facility

Non-smoking rooms

Non smoking

Recycled vegetable oil used in steam engine

Watered roads and rocked ingress egress

We are in the desert a lot and minimize driving speed to minimize dust

We encourage our guests to open windows for fresh air when night time temperatures allow. We do the same. It's nice to wake up to the birds.

## **Noise Reduction measures - Other noise reduction practices**

Don't use gas blowers.

Ear plugs for guests

Education of all staff

Hired security at night to ensure guest noise is minimal indoors and out

Insulation between rooms

Maintain use of soft music to encourage visitors to use quiet voices.

No lawn mowing, blowers, etc on Sundays

None. We engage in a ambient light reduction practice to keep our skies clear

Railroad Quiet Zone management

Sound barrier wall; plantings

Sound deadening construction of walls

Sound proofing in building

Soundproof windows

WE don't permit loud music/noise after certain hours.

We go to bed early. So do our neighbors. We are on 3.3 acres.

We sell peace & quiet

**With what industry sector are you primarily affiliated?**

Apartments  
Business community  
Casino-hotel-entertainment  
Chamber of commerce - visitor center  
Chamber of commerce  
Chamber of commerce/tourism/historical homes  
Cultural/arts  
Destination spa resort  
Eco-tour operator  
Education  
Education, public outreach and research non-profit organization  
Government  
Government  
Government attraction  
Grand Canyon river outfitter  
Guided tours  
Guiding service  
Hike & bike tours  
Hiking and rock climbing guide service  
Hopi tour service  
Hot air balloon tours  
Hotel restaurant railway  
Local visitor information center/museum  
Municipal government  
Municipality  
National monument  
National park service  
Private tourism promotion  
Resort  
Retreat center  
Retreats  
Services  
State park with camping and other attractions  
Tour operator  
Tours  
Tours  
Transportation  
Travel agent/event planning  
Utility  
Winery  
Yoga and healing center

## **Type of Lodging Property- Other**

B&B and Guest Homes/Casitas

Cabin rentals

Cabin Resort

Campground and RV Park

Dude Ranch

Guest ranch (3)

Historic B&B Inn

Inn w/breakfast off premises

Motel/Campground/RV Park

Working Guest Ranch

## What is the legal ownership of your lodging property?

Corporation (4)  
Inc. (2)  
LLC (14)  
Native community owned  
Not sure  
Private (3)  
Privately owned condos  
S Corp  
Sole member LLC  
Sole proprietorship  
Tribal (2)  
Tribal owned

**What is the legal ownership of your food service property?**

Association  
Corporation (2)  
Hotel owned  
Incorporated  
LLC (10)  
Not sure  
Private  
Sole proprietorship  
Tribal  
Tribal owned

## **DMO challenges**

Lack of funds; misuse of our BBB Tax

Lack of help from city

Money

We have hired a marketing group that covers our marketing, helps us with social media, developed our websites and continuously provides us with e-blasts and events coordination and all other sources of marketing. They are worth much more that we pay them.

## Arizona Office of Tourism assistance – Other

\$\$\$\$\$

A guide of local vendors for common things such as trash recycling

Additional promotion

Anything that will help us grow

Assist Small Businesses

Better familiarization tours

Bring more tourists into the state

Customers who embrace this mantra and bring us business news stories written about sustainability for other locations

Develop simple messaging through a major event (statewide if possible) to promote the idea and also drive traffic to the establishments involved. When there is a higher demand from the public with a direct ROI, the tourism industry will listen and participate

Directing Travel writers to smaller B & Bs

Educate Indian Tribes

Financial

Funding

Funding

Give us back some funding

Grants for exterior improvements - incorporate conservation programs at our building

List of Comm. Lenders

Love your workshops, newsletters, and stats that you have available

Marketing public tourism sites, as opposed to just commercial tourism.

Media availability

Must be local

None

None really, too busy running my business

Not sure

Nothing, not interested in the least

P/R

Promoting the White Mountains

Recognize support and promote better designated Offices of Tourism

Revenue

Spend more on bringing in all visitors; don't spend too much on small niche groups.

Supplying contacts of people who can help in the process

Support Geotourism campaign.